



Agenda Item No. (4)

To: Transportation Committee/Committee of the Whole
Meeting of April 26, 2018

From: David Davenport, Senior Planner
Ron Downing, Director of Planning
Mona Babauta, Deputy General Manager, Bus Division
Denis J. Mulligan, General Manager

Subject: **AUTHORIZE THE SETTING OF A PUBLIC HEARING TO RECEIVE
PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE PROPOSED DISCONTINUATION OF
GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT ROUTES 92 AND 93**

Recommendation

The Transportation Committee recommends that the Board of Directors authorize the setting of a public hearing to receive public comment on a proposal to discontinue Golden Gate Transit (GGT) Routes 92 and 93 due to low ridership. The public hearing would take place on Thursday, May 17, 2018, at 9:00 a.m. in the Board Room, Administration Building, Golden Gate Bridge Toll Plaza, San Francisco.

This matter will be presented to the Board of Directors at its April 27, 2018, meeting for appropriate action.

Summary

If approved, this action would set a public hearing to consider a proposal to discontinue GGT Routes 92 and 93. Board policy requires that a public hearing be held for service changes that affect 25% or more of each bus route or the discontinuation of a route. Route 93 provides shuttle service between the Golden Gate Bridge Toll Plaza and San Francisco Civic Center during weekday peak periods. Route 92 supplements Route 93, travels along the Geary Corridor, and extends across the Golden Gate Bridge to Southern Marin County. Staff recommends that Route 92 be evaluated as a regular commute route rather than a commute shuttle as designated in the SRTP, as it does not function as a shuttle.

In conjunction with this proposal, additional service would be provided on Routes 4 and 30 to accommodate displaced passengers travelling between the Toll Plaza and San Francisco Civic Center during commute periods. However, this proposal does not provide GGT service along the Geary corridor. The expansion would amount to less than 25% of existing service levels on Routes 4 and 30, so a public hearing is not required for this portion of the proposal. However, the replacement service is included in this report for informational purposes to provide a better understanding of the full context of the discontinuation of Routes 92 and 93.

Background

The Board approved the *Short-Range Transit Plan Fiscal Years 2016/17 – 2025/26* at its meeting in February 2017. The *Short-Range Transit Plan (SRTP)* establishes service and system performance metrics for all of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District's (District) transit services, including our bus service. The SRTP (Standard 1.2) sets a performance threshold of 10 passengers per trip for Commute Shuttle Routes. This standard was applied to Route 92 and 93, because the two routes were deemed to function primarily to shuttle passengers between the Golden Gate Bridge Toll Plaza, where they can transfer to/from other GGT bus routes, and San Francisco Civic Center during weekday peak periods.

Routes 92 and 93 have experienced decreasing ridership for more than a year. Ridership declines on Route 93 have ranged from 24% to 33% for the past year. During the same period, ridership declines on Route 92 have been as high as 13%. While GGT service overall has experienced a minor decline in ridership of 2.2%, the trends on these two routes far exceed the system-wide average.

As a result of that decreasing ridership, Route 93 no longer meets the service standard of 10 passengers per trip for a commute shuttle, as established in the *SRTP*. Ridership currently averages 6.4 passengers per trip, and none of the 13 trips in operation meet the standard of 10 passengers. Route 92 ridership currently averages 13.5 passengers per trip, which meets the standard. However, five of the 18 trips carry fewer than 10 people on average. It is expected that fewer trips will meet the standard in the future due to the negative ridership trend. Further, the available seating capacity on Routes 30, 70, 101, and 101X and direct Civic Center service on Routes 24 and 54 have diminished the continued need for Routes 92 and 93.

Route 92 was designed to fulfill two roles. First, it provides supplemental service to Route 93 between the Golden Gate Bridge Toll Plaza and San Francisco Civic Center. Second, it maintains peak-period service along Geary Boulevard that had been provided by Route 10, which was moved to Van Ness Avenue in 2009 to improve ridership. Route 92 is classified as a Commute Shuttle Route because of its role in supplementing Route 93. However, Route 92 is used predominantly (76% of riders) as a regular commute service and not as a shuttle. Therefore, it would be more appropriate for Route 92 to be classified as a Commute Route, which has a performance standard of 20 passengers per trip. Route 92 does not meet this higher standard, because like the Route 10 service it replaced, the Geary Boulevard corridor has low ridership. Muni offers an extremely high level of service along the Geary corridor on Routes 38 and 38R, which connect with GGT routes at Van Ness Avenue, as well as cross-town routes that connect with GGT routes on Lombard Street and at the Golden Gate Bridge Toll Plaza. The frequency of Muni service is very good, and many passengers choose to use Muni to connect with GGT services rather than use Route 92.

Proposed Changes Subject to the Public Hearing Process

Staff proposes that Routes 92 and 93 be discontinued. Route 93 does not meet the performance standard for Commute Shuttle Routes. While Route 92 does meet the standard for Commute Shuttle Routes, it functions as a Commute Route and does not meet that higher standard. The proposed service changes would be made on a permanent basis. If approved, the changes would take effect in September 2018. The cost savings of discontinuing Routes 92 and 93 is estimated at \$286,000 for Fiscal Year 2018/19.

Related Service Changes Not Subject to the Public Hearing Process

The discontinuation of Routes 92 and 93 would affect approximately 325 riders per day. At least half of these riders would have alternative service readily available on Routes 24, 30, 54, 70, 101, and 101X. However, the remaining passengers could have longer wait times or more difficult transfers between routes. Therefore, District staff proposes service enhancements on Routes 4 and 30 to mitigate the impacts to potentially affected riders travelling between the Toll Plaza and San Francisco Civic Center.

- Route 4 – One trip in each direction would be added to/from the San Francisco Civic Center. The resulting service would be similar to Routes 24 and 54, which primarily serve the San Francisco Financial District but also have one trip in each direction serving the San Francisco Civic Center.
- Route 30 – Four trips in each direction would be added between Marin City and San Francisco, with two trips in each direction during the morning and afternoon peak periods, resulting in eight new trips total. These trips would not operate on the portion of the route between Marin City and San Rafael because that portion of the route would duplicate existing service on Route 70.

The enhancements to Routes 4 and 30 reflect a 3% and 12% increase in service, respectively. These values fall below the Board-adopted threshold of 25% required for a public hearing to expand service on these two routes. The cost of enhancing Routes 4 and 30 is estimated at \$143,000 for Fiscal Year 2018/19. The net cost savings for changes to Routes 4, 30, 92, and 93 is estimated at \$143,000 for Fiscal Year 2018/19.

Title VI Impacts

Title VI guidelines issued by the Federal Transit Administration and the Title VI policy approved by the Board on August 9, 2013, dictate that major service changes, which affect 25% or more of revenue service miles per route, are analyzed for equity. This threshold will be met for Routes 92 and 93. Therefore, a Title VI equity analysis will be required prior to final approval of this change.

Public Notification

If the proposal to hold this public hearing is approved by the Board, outreach on the proposal will be conducted during the month of May. Public notification activities will include:

- A public workshop to be held at the Golden Gate Bridge Toll Plaza.
- Advertisements in the *Marin Independent Journal* announcing the public hearing.
- Posters on board buses advertising the public hearing.
- Press releases to local media.
- Social media postings on Facebook and Twitter.
- E-mail blast to customers and community-based organizations.

Translation of all printed materials and handouts in Spanish will be available, per the District's Limited English Proficiency (LEP) Plan.

Public Comment Process

Public comments on this proposal can be submitted in several different ways:

1. Attend a meeting or hearing and comment directly;
2. E-mail publichearing@goldengate.org ;and/or,
3. Send written comments to the District Secretary.

The District's practice is to treat all comments equally without regard to the manner in which the comments are submitted or received. Therefore, individuals need not attend the public hearing and provide testimony in person if they have commented through e-mail or written forms. All comments received through the above methods will be considered in the final recommendation. Comments must be submitted by 4:30 p.m. on Friday, May 18, 2018.

Fiscal Impact

The fiscal impact of providing a public hearing and associated outreach is estimated at less than \$5,000 and will be covered by the existing Marketing and Communications Department budget.