

Agenda Item No. (4)

To: Governmental Affairs and Public Information Committee/Committee of the Whole

Meeting of April 28, 2023

From: Amorette M. Ko-Wong, Secretary of the District

Denis J. Mulligan, General Manager

Subject: DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION RELATIVE TO BROWN ACT-

**RELATED BILLS** 

#### Recommendation

Staff is providing this information to the Governmental Affairs and Public Information Committee for discussion and possible action on Brown Act-related bills described below.

# **Summary**

The Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District (District) is currently tracking several Brown Act-related bills that could potentially affect the District.

Of interest, Assembly Bill (AB) 817 would relax the requirement for in-person attendance for "subsidiary bodies," such as the District's Advisory Committees (Advisory Committee on Accessibility, Bus Passenger Advisory Committee, Ferry Passenger Advisory Committee and Pedestrian and Bicyclist Advisory Committee). As currently drafted, AB 817 would make it easier to recruit and retain members of these Advisory Committees as well as having the requisite quorum for meetings. These Advisory Committees are composed of members of the public. They make recommendations to the District, but they are not decision making bodies. Given the composition and function of these Advisory Committees, the Board may think that greater flexibility regarding the physical attendance requirements under the Brown Act is appropriate for Advisory Committee meetings.

Also germane to the District, Senate Bill (SB) 537 recognizes that in-person attendance at multicounty agencies can be more challenging due to the need to travel great distances to actively participate in a meeting. Senate Bill 537 would allow a board, commission, or advisory body consisting of members appointed by more than one county, city, city and county, special district, or a joint powers entity that is subject to the Brown Act to teleconference their meetings without having to notice and make publicly accessible each teleconference location, or have at least a quorum participate from locations within the boundaries of the agency. SB 537 also updates the definition of "just cause" under AB 2449 to allow a member to teleconference in order to protect an immunocompromised child, parent, grandparent, grandchild, sibling, spouse or domestic partner. Recognizing that the boundaries of the District are about 350 miles apart, the Board may wish to take a position on SB 537.

The District's Sacramento liaison, Platinum Advisors, provided the following information related to Brown Act legislation in their previous report under Agenda Item No. 3 and it is provided here again for the purpose of today's discussion:

	Subject	Status
AB 557 (Hart D) Open meetings: local agencies: teleconferences	AB 557 would extend indefinitely the existing authorization for local legislative bodies with a majority vote to hold remote meetings if a proclaimed state of emergency exists. AB 557 would also change the requirement to reauthorize the use of remote meetings from every 30 days to every 45 days. Set for hearing in Assembly Local Government Committee on April 26, 2023.	Assembly Local Government
AB 817 (Pacheco D) Open meetings: teleconferencin g: subsidiary body.	<ul> <li>AB 817 would authorize a "subsidiary body" to remotely hold a public meeting if specified conditions are met.</li> <li>The bill defines a subsidiary body as one that meets all of the following:</li> <li>is created by another legislative body, as defined in paragraph (b) of Government Code Section 54952,</li> <li>serves exclusively as an advisory body,</li> <li>is not authorized to take final action on any contract, legislation, regulation, or permit.</li> <li>AB 817 would also require the members of the body to participate through both audio and visual technology. The public must be able to participate in the body's proceedings either by phone line or through an internet-based platform. Set for hearing in Assembly Local Government Committee on April 26, 2023.</li> </ul>	Assembly Local Government
AB 1379 (Papan D) Open meetings: local agencies: teleconferences.	<ul> <li>AB 1379 would amend the Brown Act to allow a legislative body to hold meetings in any combination of inperson or remote participation.</li> <li>The bill specifies a quorum can be established by any of the following:</li> <li>Consisting of members participating remotely.</li> <li>Consisting of members participating at a designated location.</li> <li>Consisting of members participating remotely and at a designated location.</li> <li>AB 1379 specifies that the "singular designated physical meeting location" must be open to the public and located within the legislative body's jurisdiction. Set for hearing in Assembly Local Government Committee on April 26, 2023.</li> </ul>	Assembly Local Government

	Subject	Status
SB 411 (Portantino D) Open meetings: teleconferences: bodies with appointed membership	SB 411 would authorize a legislative body as defined in the bill to use alternate teleconferencing provisions.  The bill currently defines "legislative body" to mean a board, commission, or advisory body of a local agency whose membership is appointed. Amended in the Senate Governance & Finance Committee on April 19, 2023, to apply only to neighborhood councils located in the City of Los Angeles.	To Senate Judiciary Committee
SB 537 (Becker D) Open meetings: local agencies: teleconferences.	SB 537 would authorize specified legislative bodies to hold meetings remotely. The bill would only apply to legislative bodies that are a board, commission, or advisory body of a "multijurisdictional," cross county agency, the membership of which board, commission, or advisory body is appointed.  The bill defines "multijurisdictional" to be a legislative	To Senate Judiciary Committee
	body that includes representatives from more than one county, city, city and county, special district, or a joint powers entity. While the bill would clearly allow an entity such as MTC to hold remote meetings, it would require legal counsel to review to determine if this bill would apply to a board comprised of representative from a county and multiple cities within in a single county. SB 537 was approved by the Senate Governance & Finance Committee with amendments on April 19, 2023.	

# **Fiscal Impact**

There is no direct fiscal impact in supporting proposed legislation. If any legislation is approved that would allow Board members to attend remotely there would be nominal savings in travel fees associated with attending in-person meetings.

## Attachments:

- 1. Bill Text AB 557 (Hart)
- 2. Bill Text AB 817 (Pacheco)
- 3. Bill Text AB 1379 (Papan)
- 4. Bill Text SB 411 (Portantino)
- 5. Bill Text SB 537 (Becker)

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

# **ASSEMBLY BILL**

No. 557

#### **Introduced by Assembly Member Hart**

February 8, 2023

An act to amend and repeal Section 54953 of the Government Code, relating to local government.

#### LEGISLATIVE COUNSEL'S DIGEST

AB 557, as introduced, Hart. Open meetings: local agencies: teleconferences.

(1) Existing law, the Ralph M. Brown Act, requires, with specified exceptions, that all meetings of a legislative body of a local agency, as those terms are defined, be open and public and that all persons be permitted to attend and participate. The act contains specified provisions regarding providing for the ability of the public to observe and provide comment. The act allows for meetings to occur via teleconferencing subject to certain requirements, particularly that the legislative body notice each teleconference location of each member that will be participating in the public meeting, that each teleconference location be accessible to the public, that members of the public be allowed to address the legislative body at each teleconference location, that the legislative body post an agenda at each teleconference location, and that at least a quorum of the legislative body participate from locations within the boundaries of the local agency's jurisdiction. The act provides an exemption to the jurisdictional requirement for health authorities, as defined.

Existing law, until January 1, 2024, authorizes a local agency to use teleconferencing without complying with those specified teleconferencing requirements in specified circumstances when a

AB 557 -2 -

declared state of emergency is in effect, or in other situations related to public health, as specified. If there is a continuing state of emergency, or if state or local officials have imposed or recommended measures to promote social distancing, existing law requires a legislative body to make specified findings not later than 30 days after the first teleconferenced meeting, and to make those findings every 30 days thereafter, in order to continue to meet under these abbreviated teleconferencing procedures.

Existing law requires a legislative body that holds a teleconferenced meeting under these abbreviated teleconferencing procedures to give notice of the meeting and post agendas, as described, to allow members of the public to access the meeting and address the legislative body, to give notice of the means by which members of the public may access the meeting and offer public comment, including an opportunity for all persons to attend via a call-in option or an internet-based service option. Existing law prohibits a legislative body that holds a teleconferenced meeting under these abbreviated teleconferencing procedures from requiring public comments to be submitted in advance of the meeting and would specify that the legislative body must provide an opportunity for the public to address the legislative body and offer comment in real time.

This bill would extend the above-described abbreviated teleconferencing provisions when a declared state of emergency is in effect, or in other situations related to public health, as specified, indefinitely. The bill would also extend the period for a legislative body to make the above-described findings related to a continuing state of emergency and social distancing to not later than 45 days after the first teleconferenced meeting, and every 45 days thereafter, in order to continue to meet under the abbreviated teleconferencing procedures.

The bill would additionally make nonsubstantive changes to those provisions and correct erroneous cross references .

(2) The California Constitution requires local agencies, for the purpose of ensuring public access to the meetings of public bodies and the writings of public officials and agencies, to comply with a statutory enactment that amends or enacts laws relating to public records or open meetings and contains findings demonstrating that the enactment furthers the constitutional requirements relating to this purpose.

This bill would make legislative findings to that effect.

Vote: majority. Appropriation: no. Fiscal committee: no. State-mandated local program: no.

-3- AB 557

The people of the State of California do enact as follows:

SECTION 1. Section 54953 of the Government Code, as amended by Section 1 of Chapter 285 of the Statutes of 2022, is amended to read:

- 54953. (a) All meetings of the legislative body of a local agency shall be open and public, and all persons shall be permitted to attend any meeting of the legislative body of a local agency, except as otherwise provided in this chapter.
- (b) (1) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, the legislative body of a local agency may use teleconferencing for the benefit of the public and the legislative body of a local agency in connection with any meeting or proceeding authorized by law. The teleconferenced meeting or proceeding shall comply with all otherwise applicable requirements of this chapter and all otherwise applicable provisions of law relating to a specific type of meeting or proceeding.
- (2) Teleconferencing, as authorized by this section, may be used for all purposes in connection with any meeting within the subject matter jurisdiction of the legislative body. If the legislative body of a local agency elects to use teleconferencing, the legislative body of a local agency shall comply with all of the following:
- (A) All votes taken during a teleconferenced meeting shall be by rollcall.
- (B) The teleconferenced meetings shall be conducted in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of the parties or the public appearing before the legislative body of a local agency.
- (C) The legislative body shall give notice of the meeting and post agendas as otherwise required by this chapter.
- (D) The legislative body shall allow members of the public to access the meeting and the agenda shall provide an opportunity for members of the public to address the legislative body directly pursuant to Section 54954.3.
- (3) If the legislative body of a local agency elects to use teleconferencing, it shall post agendas at all teleconference locations. Each teleconference location shall be identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting or proceeding, and each teleconference location shall be accessible to the public. During the teleconference, at least a quorum of the members of the

AB 557 —4—

legislative body shall participate from locations within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction, except as provided in subdivisions (d) and (e).

- (c) (1) No legislative body shall take action by secret ballot, whether preliminary or final.
- (2) The legislative body of a local agency shall publicly report any action taken and the vote or abstention on that action of each member present for the action.
- (3) Prior to taking final action, the legislative body shall orally report a summary of a recommendation for a final action on the salaries, salary schedules, or compensation paid in the form of fringe benefits of a local agency executive, as defined in subdivision (d) of Section 3511.1, during the open meeting in which the final action is to be taken. This paragraph shall not affect the public's right under the California Public Records Act (Division 10 (commencing with Section 7920.000) of Title 1) to inspect or copy records created or received in the process of developing the recommendation.
- (d) (1) Notwithstanding the provisions relating to a quorum in paragraph (3) of subdivision (b), if a health authority conducts a teleconference meeting, members who are outside the jurisdiction of the authority may be counted toward the establishment of a quorum when participating in the teleconference if at least 50 percent of the number of members that would establish a quorum are present within the boundaries of the territory over which the authority exercises jurisdiction, and the health authority provides a teleconference number, and associated access codes, if any, that allows any person to call in to participate in the meeting and the number and access codes are identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting.
- (2) Nothing in this subdivision shall be construed as discouraging health authority members from regularly meeting at a common physical site within the jurisdiction of the authority or from using teleconference locations within or near the jurisdiction of the authority. A teleconference meeting for which a quorum is established pursuant to this subdivision shall be subject to all other requirements of this section.
- (3) For purposes of this subdivision, a health authority means any entity created pursuant to Sections 14018.7, 14087.31, 14087.35, 14087.36, 14087.38, and 14087.9605 of the Welfare

-5- AB 557

and Institutions Code, any joint powers authority created pursuant to Article 1 (commencing with Section 6500) of Chapter 5 of Division 7 for the purpose of contracting pursuant to Section 14087.3 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, and any advisory committee to a county-sponsored health plan licensed pursuant to Chapter 2.2 (commencing with Section 1340) of Division 2 of the Health and Safety Code if the advisory committee has 12 or more members.

- (e) (1) The legislative body of a local agency may use teleconferencing without complying with the requirements of paragraph (3) of subdivision (b) if the legislative body complies with the requirements of paragraph (2) of this subdivision in any of the following circumstances:
- (A) The legislative body holds a meeting during a proclaimed state of emergency, and state or local officials have imposed or recommended measures to promote social distancing.
- (B) The legislative body holds a meeting during a proclaimed state of emergency for the purpose of determining, by majority vote, whether as a result of the emergency, meeting in person would present imminent risks to the health or safety of attendees.
- (C) The legislative body holds a meeting during a proclaimed state of emergency and has determined, by majority vote, pursuant to subparagraph (B), that, as a result of the emergency, meeting in person would present imminent risks to the health or safety of attendees.
- (2) A legislative body that holds a meeting pursuant to this subdivision shall do all of the following:
- (A) In each instance in which notice of the time of the teleconferenced meeting is otherwise given or the agenda for the meeting is otherwise posted, the legislative body shall also give notice of the means by which members of the public may access the meeting and offer public comment. The agenda shall identify and include an opportunity for all persons to attend via a call-in option or an internet-based service option.
- (B) In the event of a disruption that prevents the legislative body from broadcasting the meeting to members of the public using the call-in option or internet-based service option, or in the event of a disruption within the local agency's control that prevents members of the public from offering public comments using the call-in option or internet-based service option, the legislative body

-6-

shall take no further action on items appearing on the meeting agenda until public access to the meeting via the call-in option or internet-based service option is restored. Actions taken on agenda items during a disruption that prevents the legislative body from broadcasting the meeting may be challenged pursuant to Section 54960.1.

- (C) The legislative body shall not require public comments to be submitted in advance of the meeting and must provide an opportunity for the public to address the legislative body and offer comment in real time.
- (D) Notwithstanding Section 54953.3, an individual desiring to provide public comment through the use of an internet website, or other online platform, not under the control of the local legislative body, that requires registration to log in to a teleconference may be required to register as required by the third-party internet website or online platform to participate.
- (E) (i) A legislative body that provides a timed public comment period for each agenda item shall not close the public comment period for the agenda item, or the opportunity to register, pursuant to subparagraph  $\overline{(F)}$ ,  $\overline{(D)}$ , to provide public comment until that timed public comment period has elapsed.
- (ii) A legislative body that does not provide a timed public comment period, but takes public comment separately on each agenda item, shall allow a reasonable amount of time per agenda item to allow public members the opportunity to provide public comment, including time for members of the public to register pursuant to subparagraph (F), (D), or otherwise be recognized for the purpose of providing public comment.
- (iii) A legislative body that provides a timed general public comment period that does not correspond to a specific agenda item shall not close the public comment period or the opportunity to register, pursuant to subparagraph (F), (D), until the timed general public comment period has elapsed.
- (3) If a state of emergency remains active, or state or local officials have imposed or recommended measures to promote social distancing, in order to continue to teleconference without compliance with paragraph (3) of subdivision (b), the legislative body shall, not later than 30 45 days after teleconferencing for the first time pursuant to subparagraph (A), (B), or (C) of paragraph

\_7\_ AB 557

1 (1), and every-30 45 days thereafter, make the following findings 2 by majority vote:

- (A) The legislative body has reconsidered the circumstances of the state of emergency.
  - (B) Any of the following circumstances exist:

- (i) The state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability of the members to meet safely in person.
- (ii) State or local officials continue to impose or recommend measures to promote social distancing.
- (4) This subdivision shall not be construed to require the legislative body to provide a physical location from which the public may attend or comment.
- (f) (1) The legislative body of a local agency may use teleconferencing without complying with paragraph (3) of subdivision (b) if, during the teleconference meeting, at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body participates in person from a singular physical location clearly identified on the agenda, which location shall be open to the public and situated within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction and the legislative body complies with all of the following:
- (A) The legislative body shall provide at least one of the following as a means by which the public may remotely hear and visually observe the meeting, and remotely address the legislative body:
  - (i) A two-way audiovisual platform.
- (ii) A two-way telephonic service and a live webcasting of the meeting.
- (B) In each instance in which notice of the time of the teleconferenced meeting is otherwise given or the agenda for the meeting is otherwise posted, the legislative body shall also give notice of the means by which members of the public may access the meeting and offer public comment.
- (C) The agenda shall identify and include an opportunity for all persons to attend and address the legislative body directly pursuant to Section 54954.3 via a call-in option, via an internet-based service option, and at the in-person location of the meeting.
- (D) In the event of a disruption that prevents the legislative body from broadcasting the meeting to members of the public using the call-in option or internet-based service option, or in the event of

AB 557 —8—

a disruption within the local agency's control that prevents members of the public from offering public comments using the call-in option or internet-based service option, the legislative body shall take no further action on items appearing on the meeting agenda until public access to the meeting via the call-in option or internet-based service option is restored. Actions taken on agenda items during a disruption that prevents the legislative body from broadcasting the meeting may be challenged pursuant to Section 54960.1.

- (E) The legislative body shall not require public comments to be submitted in advance of the meeting and must provide an opportunity for the public to address the legislative body and offer comment in real time.
- (F) Notwithstanding Section 54953.3, an individual desiring to provide public comment through the use of an internet website, or other online platform, not under the control of the local legislative body, that requires registration to log in to a teleconference may be required to register as required by the third-party internet website or online platform to participate.
- (2) A member of the legislative body shall only participate in the meeting remotely pursuant to this subdivision, if all of the following requirements are met:
  - (A) One of the following circumstances applies:
- (i) The member notifies the legislative body at the earliest opportunity possible, including at the start of a regular meeting, of their need to participate remotely for just cause, including a general description of the circumstances relating to their need to appear remotely at the given meeting. The provisions of this clause shall not be used by any member of the legislative body for more than two meetings per calendar year.
- (ii) The member requests the legislative body to allow them to participate in the meeting remotely due to emergency circumstances and the legislative body takes action to approve the request. The legislative body shall request a general description of the circumstances relating to their need to appear remotely at the given meeting. A general description of an item generally need not exceed 20 words and shall not require the member to disclose any medical diagnosis or disability, or any personal medical information that is already exempt under existing law, such as the Confidentiality of Medical Information Act (Chapter 1 (commencing with Section

-9- AB 557

56) of Part 2.6 of Division 1 of the Civil Code). For the purposes of this clause, the following requirements apply:

- (I) A member shall make a request to participate remotely at a meeting pursuant to this clause as soon as possible. The member shall make a separate request for each meeting in which they seek to participate remotely.
- (II) The legislative body may take action on a request to participate remotely at the earliest opportunity. If the request does not allow sufficient time to place proposed action on such a request on the posted agenda for the meeting for which the request is made, the legislative body may take action at the beginning of the meeting in accordance with paragraph (4) of subdivision (b) of Section 54954.2.
- (B) The member shall publicly disclose at the meeting before any action is taken, whether any other individuals 18 years of age or older are present in the room at the remote location with the member, and the general nature of the member's relationship with any such individuals.
- (C) The member shall participate through both audio and visual technology.
- (3) The provisions of this subdivision shall not serve as a means for any member of a legislative body to participate in meetings of the legislative body solely by teleconference from a remote location for a period of more than three consecutive months or 20 percent of the regular meetings for the local agency within a calendar year, or more than two meetings if the legislative body regularly meets fewer than 10 times per calendar year.
- (g) The legislative body shall have and implement a procedure for receiving and swiftly resolving requests for reasonable accommodation for individuals with disabilities, consistent with the federal Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 (42 U.S.C. Sec. 12132), and resolving any doubt in favor of accessibility. In each instance in which notice of the time of the meeting is otherwise given or the agenda for the meeting is otherwise posted, the legislative body shall also give notice of the procedure for receiving and resolving requests for accommodation.
- (h) The legislative body shall conduct meetings subject to this chapter consistent with applicable civil rights and nondiscrimination laws.

AB 557 -10-

(i) (1) Nothing in this section shall prohibit a legislative body from providing the public with additional teleconference locations.

- (2) Nothing in this section shall prohibit a legislative body from providing members of the public with additional physical locations in which the public may observe and address the legislative body by electronic means.
- (j) For the purposes of this section, the following definitions shall apply:
- (1) "Emergency circumstances" means a physical or family medical emergency that prevents a member from attending in person.
  - (2) "Just cause" means any of the following:
- (A) A childcare or caregiving need of a child, parent, grandparent, grandchild, sibling, spouse, or domestic partner that requires them to participate remotely. "Child," "parent," "grandparent," "grandchild," and "sibling" have the same meaning as those terms do in Section 12945.2.
- (B) A contagious illness that prevents a member from attending in person.
- (C) A need related to a physical or mental disability as defined in Sections 12926 and 12926.1 not otherwise accommodated by subdivision (g).
- (D) Travel while on official business of the legislative body or another state or local agency.
- (3) "Remote location" means a location from which a member of a legislative body participates in a meeting pursuant to subdivision (f), other than any physical meeting location designated in the notice of the meeting. Remote locations need not be accessible to the public.
- (4) "Remote participation" means participation in a meeting by teleconference at a location other than any physical meeting location designated in the notice of the meeting. Watching or listening to a meeting via webcasting or another similar electronic medium that does not permit members to interactively hear, discuss, or deliberate on matters, does not constitute remote participation.
- 37 (5) "State of emergency" means a state of emergency proclaimed 38 pursuant to Section 8625 of the California Emergency Services 39 Act (Article 1 (commencing with Section 8550) of Chapter 7 of 40 Division 1 of Title 2).

—11— AB 557

(6) "Teleconference" means a meeting of a legislative body, the members of which are in different locations, connected by electronic means, through either audio or video, or both.

- (7) "Two-way audiovisual platform" means an online platform that provides participants with the ability to participate in a meeting via both an interactive video conference and a two-way telephonic function.
- (8) "Two-way telephonic service" means a telephone service that does not require internet access, is not provided as part of a two-way audiovisual platform, and allows participants to dial a telephone number to listen and verbally participate.
- (9) "Webcasting" means a streaming video broadcast online or on television, using streaming media technology to distribute a single content source to many simultaneous listeners and viewers.
- (k) This section shall remain in effect only until January 1, <del>2024,</del> 2026, and as of that date is repealed.
- SEC. 2. Section 54953 of the Government Code, as amended by Section 2 of Chapter 285 of the Statutes of 2022, is amended to read:
- 54953. (a) All meetings of the legislative body of a local agency shall be open and public, and all persons shall be permitted to attend any meeting of the legislative body of a local agency, except as otherwise provided in this chapter.
- (b) (1) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, the legislative body of a local agency may use teleconferencing for the benefit of the public and the legislative body of a local agency in connection with any meeting or proceeding authorized by law. The teleconferenced meeting or proceeding shall comply with all otherwise applicable requirements of this chapter and all otherwise applicable provisions of law relating to a specific type of meeting or proceeding.
- (2) Teleconferencing, as authorized by this section, may be used for all purposes in connection with any meeting within the subject matter jurisdiction of the legislative body. If the legislative body of a local agency elects to use teleconferencing, the legislative body of a local agency shall comply with all of the following:
- (A) All votes taken during a teleconferenced meeting shall be by rollcall.
- 39 (B) The teleconferenced meetings shall be conducted in a 40 manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of the

AB 557 — 12 —

1 parties or the public appearing before the legislative body of a local agency.

- (C) The legislative body shall give notice of the meeting and post agendas as otherwise required by this chapter.
- (D) The legislative body shall allow members of the public to access the meeting and the agenda shall provide an opportunity for members of the public to address the legislative body directly pursuant to Section 54954.3.
- (3) If the legislative body of a local agency elects to use teleconferencing, it shall post agendas at all teleconference locations. Each teleconference location shall be identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting or proceeding, and each teleconference location shall be accessible to the public. During the teleconference, at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body shall participate from locations within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction, except as provided in—subdivision (d). subdivisions (d) and (e).
- (c) (1) No legislative body shall take action by secret ballot, whether preliminary or final.
- (2) The legislative body of a local agency shall publicly report any action taken and the vote or abstention on that action of each member present for the action.
- (3) Prior to taking final action, the legislative body shall orally report a summary of a recommendation for a final action on the salaries, salary schedules, or compensation paid in the form of fringe benefits of a local agency executive, as defined in subdivision (d) of Section 3511.1, during the open meeting in which the final action is to be taken. This paragraph shall not affect the public's right under the California Public Records Act (Division 10 (commencing with Section 7920.000) of Title 1) to inspect or copy records created or received in the process of developing the recommendation.
- (d) (1) Notwithstanding the provisions relating to a quorum in paragraph (3) of subdivision (b), if a health authority conducts a teleconference meeting, members who are outside the jurisdiction of the authority may be counted toward the establishment of a quorum when participating in the teleconference if at least 50 percent of the number of members that would establish a quorum are present within the boundaries of the territory over which the

-13- AB 557

authority exercises jurisdiction, and the health authority provides a teleconference number, and associated access codes, if any, that allows any person to call in to participate in the meeting and the number and access codes are identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting.

- (2) Nothing in this subdivision shall be construed as discouraging health authority members from regularly meeting at a common physical site within the jurisdiction of the authority or from using teleconference locations within or near the jurisdiction of the authority. A teleconference meeting for which a quorum is established pursuant to this subdivision shall be subject to all other requirements of this section.
- (3) For purposes of this subdivision, a health authority means any entity created pursuant to Sections 14018.7, 14087.31, 14087.35, 14087.36, 14087.38, and 14087.9605 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, any joint powers authority created pursuant to Article 1 (commencing with Section 6500) of Chapter 5 of Division 7 for the purpose of contracting pursuant to Section 14087.3 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, and any advisory committee to a county-sponsored health plan licensed pursuant to Chapter 2.2 (commencing with Section 1340) of Division 2 of the Health and Safety Code if the advisory committee has 12 or more members.
- (e) (1) The legislative body of a local agency may use teleconferencing without complying with *the requirements of* paragraph (3) of subdivision (b) if, during the teleconference meeting, at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body participates in person from a singular physical location clearly identified on the agenda, which location shall be open to the public and situated within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction and the legislative body complies with all of the following:
- (A) The legislative body shall provide at least one of the following as a means by which the public may remotely hear and visually observe the meeting, and remotely address the legislative body:
- (i) A two-way audiovisual platform.
- 38 (ii) A two-way telephonic service and a live webcasting of the meeting.

AB 557 — 14 —

if the legislative body complies with the requirements of paragraph (2) of this subdivision in any of the following circumstances:

- (A) The legislative body holds a meeting during a proclaimed state of emergency, and state or local officials have imposed or recommended measures to promote social distancing.
- (B) The legislative body holds a meeting during a proclaimed state of emergency for the purpose of determining, by majority vote, whether as a result of the emergency, meeting in person would present imminent risks to the health or safety of attendees.
- (C) The legislative body holds a meeting during a proclaimed state of emergency and has determined, by majority vote, pursuant to subparagraph (B), that, as a result of the emergency, meeting in person would present imminent risks to the health or safety of attendees.
- (2) A legislative body that holds a meeting pursuant to this subdivision shall do all of the following:

<del>(B)</del>

- (A) In each instance in which notice of the time of the teleconferenced meeting is otherwise given or the agenda for the meeting is otherwise posted, the legislative body shall also give notice of the means by which members of the public may access the meeting and offer public comment. The agenda shall identify and include an opportunity for all persons to attend via a call-in option or an internet-based service option.
- (C) The agenda shall identify and include an opportunity for all persons to attend and address the legislative body directly pursuant to Section 54954.3 via a call-in option, via an internet-based service option, and at the in-person location of the meeting.

<del>(D)</del>

(B) In the event of a disruption that prevents the legislative body from broadcasting the meeting to members of the public using the call-in option or internet-based service option, or in the event of a disruption within the local agency's control that prevents members of the public from offering public comments using the call-in option or internet-based service option, the legislative body shall take no further action on items appearing on the meeting agenda until public access to the meeting via the call-in option or internet-based service option is restored. Actions taken on agenda items during a disruption that prevents the legislative body from

-15- AB 557

broadcasting the meeting may be challenged pursuant to Section54960.1.

<del>(E)</del>

- (C) The legislative body shall not require public comments to be submitted in advance of the meeting and must provide an opportunity for the public to address the legislative body and offer comment in real time.
  - <del>(F)</del>
- (D) Notwithstanding Section 54953.3, an individual desiring to provide public comment through the use of an internet website, or other online platform, not under the control of the local legislative body, that requires registration to log in to a teleconference may be required to register as required by the third-party internet website or online platform to participate.
- (2) A member of the legislative body shall only participate in the meeting remotely pursuant to this subdivision, if all of the following requirements are met:
  - (A) One of the following circumstances applies:
- (i) The member notifies the legislative body at the earliest opportunity possible, including at the start of a regular meeting, of their need to participate remotely for just cause, including a general description of the circumstances relating to their need to appear remotely at the given meeting. The provisions of this clause shall not be used by any member of the legislative body for more than two meetings per calendar year.
- (ii) The member requests the legislative body to allow them to participate in the meeting remotely due to emergency circumstances and the legislative body takes action to approve the request. The legislative body shall request a general description of the circumstances relating to their need to appear remotely at the given meeting. A general description of an item generally need not exceed 20 words and shall not require the member to disclose any medical diagnosis or disability, or any personal medical information that is already exempt under existing law, such as the Confidentiality of Medical Information Act (Chapter 1 (commencing with Section 56) of Part 2.6 of Division 1 of the Civil Code). For the purposes of this clause, the following requirements apply:
- (I) A member shall make a request to participate remotely at a meeting pursuant to this clause as soon as possible. The member

AB 557 -16-

shall make a separate request for each meeting in which they seek
 to participate remotely.
 (II) The legislative body may take action on a request to

- (II) The legislative body may take action on a request to participate remotely at the earliest opportunity. If the request does not allow sufficient time to place proposed action on such a request on the posted agenda for the meeting for which the request is made, the legislative body may take action at the beginning of the meeting in accordance with paragraph (4) of subdivision (b) of Section 54954.2.
- (B) The member shall publicly disclose at the meeting before any action is taken whether any other individuals 18 years of age or older are present in the room at the remote location with the member, and the general nature of the member's relationship with any such individuals.
- (C) The member shall participate through both audio and visual technology.
- (3) The provisions of this subdivision shall not serve as a means for any member of a legislative body to participate in meetings of the legislative body solely by teleconference from a remote location for a period of more than three consecutive months or 20 percent of the regular meetings for the local agency within a calendar year, or more than two meetings if the legislative body regularly meets fewer than 10 times per calendar year.
- (E) (i) A legislative body that provides a timed public comment period for each agenda item shall not close the public comment period for the agenda item, or the opportunity to register, pursuant to subparagraph (D), to provide public comment until that timed public comment period has elapsed.
- (ii) A legislative body that does not provide a timed public comment period, but takes public comment separately on each agenda item, shall allow a reasonable amount of time per agenda item to allow public members the opportunity to provide public comment, including time for members of the public to register pursuant to subparagraph (D), or otherwise be recognized for the purpose of providing public comment.
- (iii) A legislative body that provides a timed general public comment period that does not correspond to a specific agenda item shall not close the public comment period or the opportunity to register, pursuant to subparagraph (D), until the timed general public comment period has elapsed.

—17— AB 557

(3) If a state of emergency remains active, or state or local officials have imposed or recommended measures to promote social distancing, in order to continue to teleconference without compliance with paragraph (3) of subdivision (b), the legislative body shall, not later than 45 days after teleconferencing for the first time pursuant to subparagraph (A), (B), or (C) of paragraph (1), and every 45 days thereafter, make the following findings by majority vote:

- (A) The legislative body has reconsidered the circumstances of the state of emergency.
  - (B) Any of the following circumstances exist:

- (i) The state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability of the members to meet safely in person.
- (ii) State or local officials continue to impose or recommend measures to promote social distancing.
- (4) This subdivision shall not be construed to require the legislative body to provide a physical location from which the public may attend or comment.
- (f) The legislative body shall have and implement a procedure for receiving and swiftly resolving requests for reasonable accommodation for individuals with disabilities, consistent with the federal Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 (42 U.S.C. Sec. 12132), and resolving any doubt in favor of accessibility. In each instance in which notice of the time of the meeting is otherwise given or the agenda for the meeting is otherwise posted, the legislative body shall also give notice of the procedure for receiving and resolving requests for accommodation.
- (g) The legislative body shall conduct meetings subject to this chapter consistent with applicable civil rights and nondiscrimination laws.
- (h) (1) Nothing in this section shall prohibit a legislative body from providing the public with additional teleconference locations.
- (2) Nothing in this section shall prohibit a legislative body from providing members of the public with additional physical locations in which the public may observe and address the legislative body by electronic means.
- (i) For the purposes of this section, the following definitions shall apply:

AB 557 — 18—

1 2

(1) "Emergency circumstances" means a physical or family medical emergency that prevents a member from attending in person.

- (2) "Just cause" means any of the following:
- (A) A childcare or caregiving need of a child, parent, grandparent, grandchild, sibling, spouse, or domestic partner that requires them to participate remotely. "Child," "parent," "grandparent," "grandchild," and "sibling" have the same meaning as those terms do in Section 12945.2.
- (B) A contagious illness that prevents a member from attending in person.
- (C) A need related to a physical or mental disability as defined in Sections 12926 and 12926.1 not otherwise accommodated by subdivision (f).
- (D) Travel while on official business of the legislative body or another state or local agency.
- (3) "Remote location" means a location from which a member of a legislative body participates in a meeting pursuant to subdivision (e), other than any physical meeting location designated in the notice of the meeting. Remote locations need not be accessible to the public.
- (4) "Remote participation" means participation in a meeting by teleconference at a location other than any physical meeting location designated in the notice of the meeting. Watching or listening to a meeting via webcasting or another similar electronic medium that does not permit members to interactively hear, discuss, or deliberate on matters, does not constitute remote participation.
- (1) "State of emergency" means a state of emergency proclaimed pursuant to Section 8625 of the California Emergency Services Act (Article 1 (commencing with Section 8550) of Chapter 7 of Division 1 of Title 2).
- 33 <del>(5)</del>
  - (2) "Teleconference" means a meeting of a legislative body, the members of which are in different locations, connected by electronic means, through either audio or video, or both.
  - (6) "Two-way audiovisual platform" means an online platform that provides participants with the ability to participate in a meeting via both an interactive video conference and a two-way telephonic function.

-19 - AB 557

(7) "Two-way telephonic service" means a telephone service that does not require internet access, is not provided as part of a two-way audiovisual platform, and allows participants to dial a telephone number to listen and verbally participate.

- (8) "Webcasting" means a streaming video broadcast online or on television, using streaming media technology to distribute a single content source to many simultaneous listeners and viewers.
- (j) This section shall become operative January 1, 2024, shall remain in effect only until January 1, 2026, and as of that date is repealed.
  - (j) This section shall become operative January 1, 2026.
- SEC. 3. Section 54953 of the Government Code, as added by Section 3 of Chapter 285 of the Statutes of 2022, is repealed.
- 54953. (a) All meetings of the legislative body of a local agency shall be open and public, and all persons shall be permitted to attend any meeting of the legislative body of a local agency, except as otherwise provided in this chapter.
- (b) (1) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, the legislative body of a local agency may use teleconferencing for the benefit of the public and the legislative body of a local agency in connection with any meeting or proceeding authorized by law. The teleconferenced meeting or proceeding shall comply with all requirements of this chapter and all otherwise applicable provisions of law relating to a specific type of meeting or proceeding.
- (2) Teleconferencing, as authorized by this section, may be used for all purposes in connection with any meeting within the subject matter jurisdiction of the legislative body. All votes taken during a teleconferenced meeting shall be by rolleall.
- (3) If the legislative body of a local agency elects to use teleconferencing, it shall post agendas at all teleconference locations and conduct teleconference meetings in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of the parties or the public appearing before the legislative body of a local agency. Each teleconference location shall be identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting or proceeding, and each teleconference location shall be accessible to the public. During the teleconference, at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body shall participate from locations within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction, except as provided in subdivision (d). The agenda shall provide an

AB 557 -20

 opportunity for members of the public to address the legislative body directly pursuant to Section 54954.3 at each teleconference location.

- (4) For the purposes of this section, "teleconference" means a meeting of a legislative body, the members of which are in different locations, connected by electronic means, through either audio or video, or both. Nothing in this section shall prohibit a local agency from providing the public with additional teleconference locations.
- (c) (1) No legislative body shall take action by secret ballot, whether preliminary or final.
- (2) The legislative body of a local agency shall publicly report any action taken and the vote or abstention on that action of each member present for the action.
- (3) Prior to taking final action, the legislative body shall orally report a summary of a recommendation for a final action on the salaries, salary schedules, or compensation paid in the form of fringe benefits of a local agency executive, as defined in subdivision (d) of Section 3511.1, during the open meeting in which the final action is to be taken. This paragraph shall not affect the public's right under the California Public Records Act (Chapter 3.5 (commencing with Section 6250) of Division 7 of Title 1) to inspect or copy records created or received in the process of developing the recommendation.
- (d) (1) Notwithstanding the provisions relating to a quorum in paragraph (3) of subdivision (b), if a health authority conducts a teleconference meeting, members who are outside the jurisdiction of the authority may be counted toward the establishment of a quorum when participating in the teleconference if at least 50 percent of the number of members that would establish a quorum are present within the boundaries of the territory over which the authority exercises jurisdiction, and the health authority provides a teleconference number, and associated access codes, if any, that allows any person to call in to participate in the meeting and the number and access codes are identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting.
- (2) Nothing in this subdivision shall be construed as discouraging health authority members from regularly meeting at a common physical site within the jurisdiction of the authority or from using teleconference locations within or near the jurisdiction of the authority. A teleconference meeting for which a quorum is

**—21 —** AB 557

established pursuant to this subdivision shall be subject to all other requirements of this section.

(3) For purposes of this subdivision, a health authority means any entity created pursuant to Sections 14018.7, 14087.31, 14087.35, 14087.36, 14087.38, and 14087.9605 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, any joint powers authority created pursuant to Article 1 (commencing with Section 6500) of Chapter 5 of Division 7 for the purpose of contracting pursuant to Section 14087.3 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, and any advisory committee to a county-sponsored health plan licensed pursuant to Chapter 2.2 (commencing with Section 1340) of Division 2 of the Health and Safety Code if the advisory committee has 12 or more members

(e) This section shall become operative January 1, 2026.

SEC. 4. The Legislature finds and declares that Sections 1 and 2 of this act, which amend Section 54953 of the Government Code, furthers, within the meaning of paragraph (7) of subdivision (b) of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution, the purposes of that constitutional section as it relates to the right of public access to the meetings of local public bodies or the writings of local public officials and local agencies. Pursuant to paragraph (7) of subdivision (b) of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution, the Legislature makes the following findings:

This act is necessary to ensure minimum standards for public participation and notice requirements allowing for greater public participation in teleconference meetings.

O

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

### AMENDED IN ASSEMBLY MARCH 16, 2023

CALIFORNIA LEGISLATURE—2023-24 REGULAR SESSION

#### ASSEMBLY BILL

No. 817

# Introduced by Assembly Member Pacheco (Coauthor: Assembly Member Wilson)

February 13, 2023

An act to amend Section 54950 of the Government Code, relating to local government. add Section 54953.05 to the Government Code, relating to local government.

#### LEGISLATIVE COUNSEL'S DIGEST

AB 817, as amended, Pacheco. Local government: open meetings. *Open meetings: teleconferencing: subsidiary body.* 

Existing law, the Ralph M. Brown Act,—requires requires, with specified exceptions, each legislative body of a local agency to provide notice of the time and place for its regular meetings and an agenda containing a brief general description of each item of business to be transacted. The act also requires that all meetings of a legislative body be open and public, and that all persons be permitted to attend unless a closed session is authorized. The act generally requires for teleconferencing that the legislative body of a local agency that elects to use teleconferencing post agendas at all teleconference locations, identify each teleconference location in the notice and agenda of the meeting or proceeding, and have each teleconference location be accessible to the public. Existing law also requires that, during the teleconference, at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body participate from locations within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction.

AB 817 -2 -

Existing law, until January 1, 2024, authorizes the legislative body of a local agency to use alternate teleconferencing provisions during a proclaimed state of emergency or in other situations related to public health that exempt a legislative body from the general requirements (emergency provisions) and impose different requirements for notice, agenda, and public participation, as prescribed. The emergency provisions specify that they do not require a legislative body to provide a physical location from which the public may attend or comment.

Existing law, until January 1, 2026, authorizes the legislative body of a local agency to use alternative teleconferencing in certain circumstances related to the particular member if at least a quorum of its members participate from a singular physical location that is open to the public and situated within the agency's jurisdiction and other requirements are met, including restrictions on remote participation by a member of the legislative body.

This bill would authorize a subsidiary body, as defined, to use alternative teleconferencing provisions similar to the emergency provisions indefinitely and without regard to a state of emergency. In order to use teleconferencing pursuant to this act, the bill would require the legislative body that established the subsidiary body by charter, ordinance, resolution, or other formal action to make specified findings by majority vote, before the subsidiary body uses teleconferencing for the first time and every 12 months thereafter.

Existing constitutional provisions require that a statute that limits the right of access to the meetings of public bodies or the writings of public officials and agencies be adopted with findings demonstrating the interest protected by the limitation and the need for protecting that interest.

This bill would make legislative findings to that effect.

The California Constitution requires local agencies, for the purpose of ensuring public access to the meetings of public bodies and the writings of public officials and agencies, to comply with a statutory enactment that amends or enacts laws relating to public records or open meetings and contains findings demonstrating that the enactment furthers the constitutional requirements relating to this purpose.

This bill would make legislative findings to that effect.

This bill would make nonsubstantive changes to a provision of the Ralph M. Brown Act.

Vote: majority. Appropriation: no. Fiscal committee: no. State-mandated local program: no.

-3— AB 817

The people of the State of California do enact as follows:

SECTION 1. Section 54953.05 is added to the Government Code, to read:

- 54953.05. (a) (1) The definitions in Section 54953, as that section may be amended from time to time, apply for purposes of this section.
- (2) For purposes of this section, "subsidiary body" means a legislative body that meets all of the following:
  - (A) Is described in subdivision (b) of Section 54952.
  - (B) Serves exclusively in an advisory capacity.

1 2

- (C) Is not authorized to take final action on legislation, regulations, contracts, licenses, permits, or any other entitlements.
- (b) A subsidiary body may use teleconferencing without complying with paragraph (3) of subdivision (b) of Section 54953, if the subsidiary body complies with all of the following:
- (1) The teleconferenced meetings shall be conducted in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of the parties or the public appearing before the subsidiary body.
- (2) Each member of the subsidiary body shall participate through both audio and visual technology.
- (3) The subsidiary body shall provide at least one of the following as a means by which the public may remotely hear and visually observe the meeting, and remotely address the subsidiary body:
  - (A) A two-way audiovisual platform.
- (B) A two-way telephonic service and a live webcasting of the meeting.
- (4) The subsidiary body shall give notice of the meeting and post agendas as otherwise required by this chapter.
- (5) In each instance in which notice of the time of the teleconferenced meeting is otherwise given or the agenda for the meeting is otherwise posted, the subsidiary body shall also give notice of the means by which members of the public may access the meeting and offer public comment.
- (6) The agenda shall identify and include an opportunity for all persons to attend and address the subsidiary body directly pursuant to Section 54954.3 via a call-in option or via an internet-based service option.

AB 817 —4—

(7) In the event of a disruption that prevents the subsidiary body from broadcasting the meeting to members of the public using the call-in option or internet-based service option, or in the event of a disruption within the subsidiary body's control that prevents members of the public from offering public comments using the call-in option or internet-based service option, the subsidiary body shall take no further action on items appearing on the meeting agenda until public access to the meeting via the call-in option or internet-based service option is restored. Actions taken on agenda items during a disruption that prevents the subsidiary body from broadcasting the meeting may be challenged pursuant to Section 54960.1.

- (8) Notwithstanding Section 54953.3, an individual desiring to provide public comment through the use of an internet website, or other online platform, not under the control of the subsidiary body, that requires registration to log in to a teleconference may be required to register as required by the third-party internet website or online platform to participate.
- (9) The subsidiary body shall not require public comments to be submitted in advance of the meeting and must provide an opportunity for the public to address the subsidiary body and offer comment in real time.
- (A) A subsidiary body that provides a timed public comment period for each agenda item shall not close the public comment period for the agenda item, or the opportunity to register, pursuant to paragraph (8), to provide public comment until that timed public comment period has elapsed.
- (B) A subsidiary body that does not provide a timed public comment period, but takes public comment separately on each agenda item, shall allow a reasonable amount of time per agenda item to allow public members the opportunity to provide public comment, including time for members of the public to register pursuant to paragraph (8), or otherwise be recognized for the purpose of providing public comment.
- (C) A subsidiary body that provides a timed general public comment period that does not correspond to a specific agenda item shall not close the public comment period or the opportunity to register, pursuant to paragraph (8), until the timed general public comment period has elapsed.

\_5\_ AB 817

(c) In order to use teleconferencing pursuant to this section, the legislative body that established the subsidiary body by charter, ordinance, resolution, or other formal action shall make the following findings by majority vote before the subsidiary body uses teleconferencing pursuant to this section for the first time, and every 12 months thereafter:

- (1) The legislative body has considered the circumstances of the subsidiary body.
- (2) Teleconference meetings of the subsidiary body would enhance public access to meetings of the subsidiary body.
- (3) Teleconference meetings of the subsidiary body would promote the attraction, retention, and diversity of subsidiary body members.
- SEC. 2. The Legislature finds and declares that Section 1 of this act, which adds Section 54953.05 to the Government Code, imposes a limitation on the public's right of access to the meetings of public bodies or the writings of public officials and agencies within the meaning of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution. Pursuant to that constitutional provision, the Legislature makes the following findings to demonstrate the interest protected by this limitation and the need for protecting that interest:

By removing the requirement for agendas to be placed at the location of each public official participating in a public meeting remotely, this act protects the personal, private information of public officials and their families while preserving the public's right to access information concerning the conduct of the people's business.

SEC. 3. The Legislature finds and declares that Section 1 of this act, which adds Section 54953.05 to the Government Code, furthers, within the meaning of paragraph (7) of subdivision (b) of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution, the purposes of that constitutional section as it relates to the right of public access to the meetings of local public bodies or the writings of local public officials and local agencies. Pursuant to paragraph (7) of subdivision (b) of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution, the Legislature makes the following findings:

This act is necessary to provide opportunities for public participation in meetings of specified public agencies and to promote the attraction and retention of members of those agencies.

-6-

1 SECTION 1. Section 54950 of the Government Code is 2 amended to read:

54950. (a) In enacting this chapter, the Legislature finds and declares that the public commissions, boards, councils, and the other public agencies in this state exist to aid in the conduct of the people's business. It is the intent of the law that their actions be taken openly and that their deliberations be conducted openly.

(b) The people of this state do not yield their sovereignty to the agencies that serve them. The people, in delegating authority, do not give their public servants the right to decide what is good for the people to know and what is not good for them to know. The people insist on remaining informed, so that they may retain control over the instruments they have created.

## AMENDED IN ASSEMBLY MARCH 23, 2023

CALIFORNIA LEGISLATURE—2023–24 REGULAR SESSION

# ASSEMBLY BILL

No. 1379

#### **Introduced by Assembly Member Papan**

February 17, 2023

An act to amend Section 53908 of and repeal Section 54953 of the Government Code, relating to local government.

#### LEGISLATIVE COUNSEL'S DIGEST

AB 1379, as amended, Papan. Local agencies: financial affairs. Open meetings: local agencies: teleconferences.

Existing law, the Ralph M. Brown Act, requires, with specified exceptions, that all meetings of a legislative body be open and public, and that all persons be permitted to attend unless a closed session is authorized. The act generally requires for teleconferencing that the legislative body of a local agency that elects to use teleconferencing post agendas at all teleconference locations, identify each teleconference location in the notice and agenda of the meeting or proceeding, and have each teleconference location be accessible to the public. Existing law also requires that, during the teleconference, at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body participate from locations within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction.

This bill, with respect to those general provisions on teleconferencing, would require a legislative body electing to use teleconferencing to instead post agendas at a singular designated physical meeting location, as defined, rather than at all teleconference locations. The bill would remove the requirements for the legislative body of the local agency to identify each teleconference location in the notice and agenda, that

AB 1379 -2-

each teleconference location be accessible to the public, and that at least a quorum of the members participate from locations within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction. The bill would instead provide that, for purposes of establishing a quorum of the legislative body, members of the body may participate remotely, at the designated physical location, or at both the designated physical meeting location and remotely. The bill would require the legislative body to have at least 2 meetings per year in which the legislative body's members are in person at a singular designated physical meeting location.

Existing law, until January 1, 2026, authorizes the legislative body of a local agency to use alternative teleconferencing provisions without complying with the general teleconferencing requirements that agendas be posted at each teleconference, that each teleconference location be identified in the notice and agenda, and that each teleconference location be accessible to the public, if at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body participates in person from a singular physical location clearly identified on the agenda that is open to the public and situated within the local agency's jurisdiction. Under existing law, these alternative teleconferencing provisions require the legislative body to provide at least one of 2 specified means by which the public may remotely hear and visually observe the meeting. Under existing law, these alternative teleconferencing provisions authorize a member to participate remotely if the member is participating remotely for just cause, limited to twice per year, or due to emergency circumstances, contingent upon a request to, and action by, the legislative body, as prescribed. Existing law specifies that just cause includes travel while on official business of the legislative body or another state or local agency.

This bill would revise the alternative provisions, operative until January 1, 2026, to make these provisions operative indefinitely. The bill would delete the restriction that prohibits a member, based on just cause, from participating remotely for more than 2 meetings per calendar year. The bill would delete the requirement for the legislative body to provide at least one of 2 specified means by which the public may remotely hear and visually observe the meeting. The bill would also delete a provision that requires a member participating remotely to publicly disclose at the meeting before action is taken whether there are individuals 18 years of age present in the room at the remote location and the general nature of the member's relationship to those

-3- AB 1379

individuals. The bill would further delete a provision that prohibits a member from participating remotely for a period of more than 3 consecutive months or 20% of the regular meetings within a calendar year, or more than 2 meetings if the legislative body regularly meets fewer than 10 times per calendar year. The bill would expand the definition of just cause to include travel related to a member of a legislative body's occupation. The bill would make related, conforming changes.

Existing constitutional provisions require that a statute that limits the right of access to the meetings of public bodies or the writings of public officials and agencies be adopted with findings demonstrating the interest protected by the limitation and the need for protecting that interest.

This bill would make legislative findings to that effect.

The California Constitution requires local agencies, for the purpose of ensuring public access to the meetings of public bodies and the writings of public officials and agencies, to comply with a statutory enactment that amends or enacts laws relating to public records or open meetings and contains findings demonstrating that the enactment furthers the constitutional requirements relating to this purpose.

This bill would make legislative findings to that effect.

Existing law requires that the officer of each local agency who has charge of the financial records furnish to the Controller a report of all the financial transactions of the local agency during the preceding fiscal year. If a local agency maintains an internet website, existing law requires that the local agency post information on the annual compensation of its elected officials, as specified.

This bill would make nonsubstantive changes to that law.

Vote: majority. Appropriation: no. Fiscal committee: no-yes. State-mandated local program: no-yes.

*The people of the State of California do enact as follows:* 

- 1 SECTION 1. Section 54953 of the Government Code, as
- 2 amended by Section 2 of Chapter 285 of the Statutes of 2022, is
- 3 amended to read:
- 4 54953. (a) All meetings of the legislative body of a local
- 5 agency shall be open and public, and all persons shall be permitted
- 6 to attend any meeting of the legislative body of a local agency,
- 7 except as otherwise provided in this chapter.

AB 1379 —4—

 (b) (1) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, the legislative body of a local agency may use teleconferencing for the benefit of the public and the legislative body of a local agency in connection with any meeting or proceeding authorized by law. The teleconferenced meeting or proceeding shall comply with all otherwise applicable requirements of this chapter and all otherwise applicable provisions of law relating to a specific type of meeting or proceeding.

- (2) Teleconferencing, as authorized by this section, may be used for all purposes in connection with any meeting within the subject matter jurisdiction of the legislative body. If the legislative body of a local agency elects to use teleconferencing, the legislative body of a local agency shall comply with all of the following:
- (A) All votes taken during a teleconferenced meeting shall be by rollcall.
- (B) The teleconferenced meetings shall be conducted in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of the parties or the public appearing before the legislative body of a local agency.
- (C) The legislative body shall give notice of the meeting and post agendas as otherwise required by this chapter.
- (D) The legislative body shall allow members of the public to access the meeting and the agenda shall provide an opportunity for members of the public to address the legislative body directly pursuant to Section 54954.3.
- (3) (A) If the legislative body of a local agency elects to use teleconferencing, it shall post agendas at—all teleconference locations. Each teleconference location shall be identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting or proceeding, and each teleconference location shall be accessible to the public. During the teleconference, at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body shall participate from locations within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction, except as provided in subdivision (d). the singular designated physical meeting location, as defined in subparagraph (B). Establishment of a quorum of a legislative body may include all of the following:
- 38 (i) A legislative body consisting of members participating 39 remotely.

\_5\_ AB 1379

(ii) A legislative body consisting of members participating at the designated physical meeting location.

- (iii) A legislative body consisting of members participating at the designated physical meeting location and members participating remotely.
- (B) "Singular designated physical meeting location" means the location that is clearly identified on the agenda, is open to the public and situated within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction, and the legislative body provides at least one of the following as a means by which the public may remotely hear and visually observe the meeting, and remotely address the legislative body:
  - (i) A two-way audiovisual platform.
  - (ii) A two-way telephonic service.

- (C) The legislative body shall have at least two meetings per calendar year in which the legislative body's members are in person at a singular designated physical meeting location.
- (c) (1) No legislative body shall take action by secret ballot, whether preliminary or final.
- (2) The legislative body of a local agency shall publicly report any action taken and the vote or abstention on that action of each member present for the action.
- (3) Prior to taking final action, the legislative body shall orally report a summary of a recommendation for a final action on the salaries, salary schedules, or compensation paid in the form of fringe benefits of a local agency executive, as defined in subdivision (d) of Section 3511.1, during the open meeting in which the final action is to be taken. This paragraph shall not affect the public's right under the California Public Records Act (Division 10 (commencing with Section 7920.000) of Title 1) to inspect or copy records created or received in the process of developing the recommendation.
- (d) (1) Notwithstanding the provisions relating to a quorum in paragraph (3) of subdivision (b), if a health authority conducts a teleconference meeting, members who are outside the jurisdiction of the authority may be counted toward the establishment of a quorum when participating in the teleconference if at least 50 percent of the number of members that would establish a quorum are present within the boundaries of the territory over which the authority exercises jurisdiction, and the health authority provides

AB 1379 -6-

a teleconference number, and associated access codes, if any, that allows any person to call in to participate in the meeting and the number and access codes are identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting.

- (2) Nothing in this subdivision shall be construed as discouraging health authority members from regularly meeting at a common physical site within the jurisdiction of the authority or from using teleconference locations within or near the jurisdiction of the authority. A teleconference meeting for which a quorum is established pursuant to this subdivision shall be subject to all other requirements of this section.
- (3) For purposes of this subdivision, a health authority means any entity created pursuant to Sections 14018.7, 14087.31, 14087.35, 14087.36, 14087.38, and 14087.9605 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, any joint powers authority created pursuant to Article 1 (commencing with Section 6500) of Chapter 5 of Division 7 for the purpose of contracting pursuant to Section 14087.3 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, and any advisory committee to a county-sponsored health plan licensed pursuant to Chapter 2.2 (commencing with Section 1340) of Division 2 of the Health and Safety Code if the advisory committee has 12 or more members.
- (e) (1) The legislative body of a local agency may *also* use teleconferencing without complying in accordance with paragraph (3) of subdivision (b) if, during the teleconference meeting, at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body participates in person from a singular physical location clearly identified on the agenda, which location shall be open to the public and situated within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction and the legislative body complies with all of the following: the legislative body complies with all of the following:
- (A) The legislative body shall provide at least one of the following as a means by which the public may remotely hear and visually observe the meeting, and remotely address the legislative body:
- 37 (i) A two-way audiovisual platform.
  - (ii) A two-way telephonic service and a live webcasting of the meeting.
- 40 <del>(B)</del>

—7— AB 1379

(A) In each instance in which notice of the time of the teleconferenced meeting is otherwise given or the agenda for the meeting is otherwise posted, the legislative body shall also give notice of the means by which members of the public may access the meeting and offer public comment.

<del>(C)</del>

(*B*) The agenda shall identify and include an opportunity for all persons to attend and address the legislative body directly pursuant to Section 54954.3 via a call-in option, via an internet-based service option, and at the in-person location of the meeting.

<del>(D)</del>

(C) In the event of a disruption that prevents the legislative body from broadcasting the meeting to members of the public using the call-in option or internet-based service option, or in the event of a disruption within the local agency's control that prevents members of the public from offering public comments using the call-in option or internet-based service option, the legislative body shall take no further action on items appearing on the meeting agenda until public access to the meeting via the call-in option or internet-based service option is restored. Actions taken on agenda items during a disruption that prevents the legislative body from broadcasting the meeting may be challenged pursuant to Section 54960.1.

<del>(E)</del>

(D) The legislative body shall not require public comments to be submitted in advance of the meeting and must provide an opportunity for the public to address the legislative body and offer comment in real time.

<del>(F)</del>

- (E) Notwithstanding Section 54953.3, an individual desiring to provide public comment through the use of an internet website, or other online platform, not under the control of the local legislative body, that requires registration to log in to a teleconference may be required to register as required by the third-party internet website or online platform to participate.
- (2) A member of the legislative body shall only participate in the meeting remotely pursuant to this subdivision, if all of the following requirements are met:
  - (A) One of the following circumstances applies:

AB 1379 — 8 —

(i) The member notifies the legislative body at the earliest opportunity possible, including at the start of a regular meeting, of their need to participate remotely for just cause, including a general description of the circumstances relating to their need to appear remotely at the given meeting. The provisions of this clause shall not be used by any member of the legislative body for more than two meetings per calendar year.

- (ii) The member requests the legislative body to allow them to participate in the meeting remotely due to emergency circumstances and the legislative body takes action to approve the request. The legislative body shall request a general description of the circumstances relating to their need to appear remotely at the given meeting. A general description of an item generally need not exceed 20 words and shall not require the member to disclose any medical diagnosis or disability, or any personal medical information that is already exempt under existing law, such as the Confidentiality of Medical Information Act (Chapter 1 (commencing with Section 56) of Part 2.6 of Division 1 of the Civil Code). For the purposes of this clause, the following requirements apply:
- (I) A member shall make a request to participate remotely at a meeting pursuant to this clause as soon as possible. The member shall make a separate request for each meeting in which they seek to participate remotely.
- (II) The legislative body may take action on a request to participate remotely at the earliest opportunity. If the request does not allow sufficient time to place proposed action on such a request on the posted agenda for the meeting for which the request is made, the legislative body may take action at the beginning of the meeting in accordance with paragraph (4) of subdivision (b) of Section 54954.2.
- (B) The member shall publicly disclose at the meeting before any action is taken whether any other individuals 18 years of age or older are present in the room at the remote location with the member, and the general nature of the member's relationship with any such individuals.

(C)

- (*B*) The member shall participate through both audio and visual technology.
- (3) The provisions of this subdivision shall not serve as a means for any member of a legislative body to participate in meetings of

-9- AB 1379

the legislative body solely by teleconference from a remote location for a period of more than three consecutive months or 20 percent of the regular meetings for the local agency within a calendar year, or more than two meetings if the legislative body regularly meets fewer than 10 times per calendar year.

- (f) The legislative body shall have and implement a procedure for receiving and swiftly resolving requests for reasonable accommodation for individuals with disabilities, consistent with the federal Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 (42 U.S.C. Sec. 12132), and resolving any doubt in favor of accessibility. In each instance in which notice of the time of the meeting is otherwise given or the agenda for the meeting is otherwise posted, the legislative body shall also give notice of the procedure for receiving and resolving requests for accommodation.
- (g) The legislative body shall conduct meetings subject to this chapter consistent with applicable civil rights and nondiscrimination laws.
- (h) (1) Nothing in this section shall prohibit a legislative body from providing the public with additional teleconference locations.
- (2) Nothing in this section shall prohibit a legislative body from providing members of the public with additional physical locations in which the public may observe and address the legislative body by electronic means.
- (i) For the purposes of this section, the following definitions shall apply:
- (1) "Emergency circumstances" means a physical or family medical emergency that prevents a member from attending in person.
  - (2) "Just cause" means any of the following:
- (A) A childcare or caregiving need of a child, parent, grandparent, grandchild, sibling, spouse, or domestic partner that requires them to participate remotely. "Child," "parent," "grandparent," "grandchild," and "sibling" have the same meaning as those terms do in Section 12945.2.
- (B) A contagious illness that prevents a member from attending in person.
- (C) A need related to a physical or mental disability as defined in Sections 12926 and 12926.1 not otherwise accommodated by subdivision (f).

AB 1379 — 10 —

 (D) Travel while on official business of the legislative body or another state or local-agency. agency, or travel related to a member of a legislative body's occupation.

- (3) "Remote location" means a location from which a member of a legislative body participates in a meeting pursuant to subdivision (e), other than any physical meeting location designated in the notice of the meeting. Remote locations need not be accessible to the public.
- (4) "Remote participation" means participation in a meeting by teleconference at a location other than any physical meeting location designated in the notice of the meeting. Watching or listening to a meeting via webcasting or another similar electronic medium that does not permit members to interactively hear, discuss, or deliberate on matters, does not constitute remote participation.
- (5) "Teleconference" means a meeting of a legislative body, the members of which are in different locations, connected by electronic means, through either audio or video, or both.
- (6) "Two-way audiovisual platform" means an online platform that provides participants with the ability to participate in a meeting via both an interactive video conference and a two-way telephonic function.
- (7) "Two-way telephonic service" means a telephone service that does not require internet access, is not provided as part of a two-way audiovisual platform, and allows participants to dial a telephone number to listen and verbally participate.
- (8) "Webcasting" means a streaming video broadcast online or on television, using streaming media technology to distribute a single content source to many simultaneous listeners and viewers.
- (j) This section shall become operative January 1, <del>2024, shall remain in effect only until January 1, 2026, and as of that date is repealed.</del> 2024.
- SEC. 2. Section 54953 of the Government Code, as added by Section 3 of Chapter 285 of the Statutes of 2022, is repealed.
- 54953. (a) All meetings of the legislative body of a local agency shall be open and public, and all persons shall be permitted to attend any meeting of the legislative body of a local agency, except as otherwise provided in this chapter.
- (b) (1) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, the legislative body of a local agency may use teleconferencing for

-11- AB 1379

the benefit of the public and the legislative body of a local agency in connection with any meeting or proceeding authorized by law. The teleconferenced meeting or proceeding shall comply with all requirements of this chapter and all otherwise applicable provisions of law relating to a specific type of meeting or proceeding.

- (2) Teleconferencing, as authorized by this section, may be used for all purposes in connection with any meeting within the subject matter jurisdiction of the legislative body. All votes taken during a teleconferenced meeting shall be by rolleall.
- (3) If the legislative body of a local agency elects to use teleconferencing, it shall post agendas at all teleconference locations and conduct teleconference meetings in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of the parties or the public appearing before the legislative body of a local agency. Each teleconference location shall be identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting or proceeding, and each teleconference location shall be accessible to the public. During the teleconference, at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body shall participate from locations within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction, except as provided in subdivision (d). The agenda shall provide an opportunity for members of the public to address the legislative body directly pursuant to Section 54954.3 at each teleconference location.
- (4) For the purposes of this section, "teleconference" means a meeting of a legislative body, the members of which are in different locations, connected by electronic means, through either audio or video, or both. Nothing in this section shall prohibit a local agency from providing the public with additional teleconference locations.
- (c) (1) No legislative body shall take action by secret ballot, whether preliminary or final.
- (2) The legislative body of a local agency shall publicly report any action taken and the vote or abstention on that action of each member present for the action.
- (3) Prior to taking final action, the legislative body shall orally report a summary of a recommendation for a final action on the salaries, salary schedules, or compensation paid in the form of fringe benefits of a local agency executive, as defined in subdivision (d) of Section 3511.1, during the open meeting in which the final action is to be taken. This paragraph shall not affect

AB 1379 — 12 —

the public's right under the California Public Records Act (Chapter 3.5 (commencing with Section 6250) of Division 7 of Title 1) to inspect or copy records created or received in the process of developing the recommendation.

- (d) (1) Notwithstanding the provisions relating to a quorum in paragraph (3) of subdivision (b), if a health authority conducts a teleconference meeting, members who are outside the jurisdiction of the authority may be counted toward the establishment of a quorum when participating in the teleconference if at least 50 percent of the number of members that would establish a quorum are present within the boundaries of the territory over which the authority exercises jurisdiction, and the health authority provides a teleconference number, and associated access codes, if any, that allows any person to call in to participate in the meeting and the number and access codes are identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting.
- (2) Nothing in this subdivision shall be construed as discouraging health authority members from regularly meeting at a common physical site within the jurisdiction of the authority or from using teleconference locations within or near the jurisdiction of the authority. A teleconference meeting for which a quorum is established pursuant to this subdivision shall be subject to all other requirements of this section.
- (3) For purposes of this subdivision, a health authority means any entity created pursuant to Sections 14018.7, 14087.31, 14087.35, 14087.36, 14087.38, and 14087.9605 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, any joint powers authority created pursuant to Article 1 (commencing with Section 6500) of Chapter 5 of Division 7 for the purpose of contracting pursuant to Section 14087.3 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, and any advisory committee to a county-sponsored health plan licensed pursuant to Chapter 2.2 (commencing with Section 1340) of Division 2 of the Health and Safety Code if the advisory committee has 12 or more members.
  - (e) This section shall become operative January 1, 2026.
- SEC. 3. The Legislature finds and declares that Section 1 of this act, which amends Section 54953 of the Government Code, imposes a limitation on the public's right of access to the meetings of public bodies or the writings of public officials and agencies within the meaning of Section 3 of Article I of the California

-13- AB 1379

Constitution. Pursuant to that constitutional provision, the Legislature makes the following findings to demonstrate the interest protected by this limitation and the need for protecting that interest:

By removing the requirement for agendas to be posted at all teleconference locations, and removing the requirement for members to publicly disclose whether any other individuals 18 years of age or older are present at the remote location with the member, and the general nature of the member's relationship with individuals before action is taken, this act protects the personal, private information of public officials and their families while preserving the public's right to access information concerning the conduct of the people's business.

SEC. 4. The Legislature finds and declares that Section 1 of this act, which amends Section 54953 of the Government Code, furthers, within the meaning of paragraph (7) of subdivision (b) of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution, the purposes of that constitutional section as it relates to the right of public access to the meetings of local public bodies or the writings of local public officials and local agencies. Pursuant to paragraph (7) of subdivision (b) of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution, the Legislature makes the following findings:

This act is necessary to ensure minimum standards for public participation and notice requirements allowing for greater public participation in teleconference meetings.

SECTION 1. Section 53908 of the Government Code is amended to read:

53908. (a) If a local agency, which is required to report to the Controller under Section 53891, maintains an internet website, it shall post, in a conspicuous location on its internet website, information on the annual compensation of its elected officials, officers, and employees that is submitted to the Controller under Section 53891.

(b) A local agency may comply with subdivision (a) by posting, in a conspicuous location on its internet website, a link to the Controller's Government Compensation in California internet website.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

# Introduced by Senator Portantino (Coauthor: Senator Menjivar)

(Coauthor: Assembly Member Luz Rivas)

February 9, 2023

An act to add Section 54953.4 to the Government Code, relating to local government, and declaring the urgency thereof, to take effect immediately.

### LEGISLATIVE COUNSEL'S DIGEST

SB 411, as introduced, Portantino. Open meetings: teleconferences: bodies with appointed membership.

Existing law, the Ralph M. Brown Act, requires, with specified exceptions, that all meetings of a legislative body, as defined, of a local agency be open and public and that all persons be permitted to attend and participate. The act generally requires for teleconferencing that the legislative body of a local agency that elects to use teleconferencing post agendas at all teleconference locations, identify each teleconference location in the notice and agenda of the meeting or proceeding, and have each teleconference location be accessible to the public. Existing law also requires that, during the teleconference, at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body participate from locations within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction. The act provides an exemption to the jurisdictional requirement for health authorities, as defined.

Existing law, until January 1, 2024, authorizes the legislative body of a local agency to use alternate teleconferencing provisions during a proclaimed state of emergency or in other situations related to public health that exempt a legislative body from the general requirements (emergency provisions) and impose different requirements for notice,

SB 411 -2-

agenda, and public participation, as prescribed. The emergency provisions specify that they do not require a legislative body to provide a physical location from which the public may attend or comment.

Existing law, until January 1, 2026, authorizes the legislative body of a local agency to use alternative teleconferencing in certain circumstances related to the particular member if at least a quorum of its members participate from a singular physical location that is open to the public and situated within the agency's jurisdiction and other requirements are met, including restrictions on remote participation by a member of the legislative body.

This bill would authorize a legislative body to use alternate teleconferencing provisions similar to the emergency provisions indefinitely and without regard to a state of emergency. The bill would alternatively define "legislative body" for this purpose to mean a board, commission, or advisory body of a local agency, the membership of which board, commission, or advisory body is appointed and which board, commission, or advisory body is otherwise subject to the act.

Existing constitutional provisions require that a statute that limits the right of access to the meetings of public bodies or the writings of public officials and agencies be adopted with findings demonstrating the interest protected by the limitation and the need for protecting that interest.

This bill would make legislative findings to that effect.

The California Constitution requires local agencies, for the purpose of ensuring public access to the meetings of public bodies and the writings of public officials and agencies, to comply with a statutory enactment that amends or enacts laws relating to public records or open meetings and contains findings demonstrating that the enactment furthers the constitutional requirements relating to this purpose.

This bill would make legislative findings to that effect.

This bill would declare that it is to take effect immediately as an urgency statute.

Vote:  $\frac{2}{3}$ . Appropriation: no. Fiscal committee: no. State-mandated local program: no.

The people of the State of California do enact as follows:

1 SECTION 1. Section 54953.4 is added to the Government 2 Code, to read:

\_3\_ SB 411

54953.4. (a) (1) A legislative body included in subdivision (c) may use teleconferencing without complying with paragraph (3) of subdivision (b) of Section 54953 if the legislative body complies with paragraph (2) of this section.

- (2) A legislative body that holds a meeting pursuant to this subdivision shall do all of the following:
- (A) In each instance in which notice of the time of the teleconferenced meeting is otherwise given or the agenda for the meeting is otherwise posted, the legislative body shall also give notice of the means by which members of the public may access the meeting and offer public comment. The agenda shall identify and include an opportunity for all persons to attend via a call-in option or an internet-based service option.
- (B) In the event of a disruption that prevents the legislative body from broadcasting the meeting to members of the public using the call-in option or internet-based service option, or in the event of a disruption within the local agency's control that prevents members of the public from offering public comments using the call-in option or internet-based service option, the legislative body shall take no further action on items appearing on the meeting agenda until public access to the meeting via the call-in option or internet-based service option is restored. Actions taken on agenda items during a disruption that prevents the legislative body of a neighborhood council from broadcasting the meeting may be challenged pursuant to Section 54960.1.
- (C) The legislative body shall not require public comments to be submitted in advance of the meeting and must provide an opportunity for the public to address the legislative body and offer comment in real time.
- (D) Notwithstanding Section 54953.3, an individual desiring to provide public comment through the use of an internet website, or other online platform, not under the control of the legislative body, that requires registration to log in to a teleconference may be required to register as required by the third-party internet website or online platform to participate.
- (E) (i) A legislative body that provides a timed public comment period for each agenda item shall not close the public comment period for the agenda item, or the opportunity to register, pursuant to subparagraph (D), to provide public comment until that timed public comment period has elapsed.

SB 411 —4—

(ii) A legislative body that does not provide a timed public comment period, but takes public comment separately on each agenda item, shall allow a reasonable amount of time per agenda item to allow public members the opportunity to provide public comment, including time for members of the public to register pursuant to subparagraph (D), or otherwise be recognized for the purpose of providing public comment.

- (iii) A legislative body that provides a timed general public comment period that does not correspond to a specific agenda item shall not close the public comment period or the opportunity to register, pursuant to subparagraph (D), until the timed general public comment period has elapsed.
- (3) This subdivision shall not be construed to require the legislative body to provide a physical location from which the public may attend or comment.
- (b) The legislative body shall comply with all other requirements of Section 54953.
- (c) As used in this section, "legislative body" means a board, commission, or advisory body of a local agency, the membership of which board, commission, or advisory body is appointed and which board, commission, or advisory body is otherwise subject to this chapter. As used in this subdivision, "advisory body" includes, but is not limited to, a neighborhood council that is an advisory body with the purpose to promote more citizen participation in government and make government more responsive to local needs that is established pursuant to the charter of a city with a population of more than 3,000,000 people that is subject to this chapter.
- SEC. 2. The Legislature finds and declares that Section 1 of this act, which adds Section 54953.4 to the Government Code, imposes a limitation on the public's right of access to the meetings of public bodies or the writings of public officials and agencies within the meaning of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution. Pursuant to that constitutional provision, the Legislature makes the following findings to demonstrate the interest protected by this limitation and the need for protecting that interest:
- During the COVID-19 public health emergency, audio and video teleconference were widely used to conduct public meetings in lieu of physical location meetings, and those public meetings have been productive, increased public participation by all members of

\_5\_ SB 411

the public regardless of their location and ability to travel to physical meeting locations, increased the pool of people who are able to serve on these bodies, and protected the health and safety of civil servants and the public. Extending the operation of teleconference as conducted during the COVID-19 public health emergency for bodies of local agencies with appointed membership will continue these benefits.

SEC. 3. The Legislature finds and declares that Section 1 of this act, which adds Section 54953.4 to the Government Code, furthers, within the meaning of paragraph (7) of subdivision (b) of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution, the purposes of that constitutional section as it relates to the right of public access to the meetings of local public bodies or the writings of local public officials and local agencies. Pursuant to paragraph (7) of subdivision (b) of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution, the Legislature makes the following findings:

During the COVID-19 public health emergency, audio and video teleconference were widely used to conduct public meetings in lieu of physical location meetings, and those public meetings have been productive, increased public participation by all members of the public regardless of their location and ability to travel to physical meeting locations, increased the pool of people who are able to serve on these bodies, and protected the health and safety of civil servants and the public. Extending the operation of teleconference as conducted during the COVID-19 public health emergency for bodies of local agencies with appointed membership will continue these benefits.

SEC. 4. This act is an urgency statute necessary for the immediate preservation of the public peace, health, or safety within the meaning of Article IV of the California Constitution and shall go into immediate effect. The facts constituting the necessity are:

Virtual meetings have allowed much easier access to appointed bodies of local agencies with far more members of the public participating in each meeting. This has created greater equity in the process and fostered the health of our democracy. In-person meetings may jeopardize the health and safety of vulnerable citizens due to ongoing risks of COVID-19 and other illnesses.

O

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

## AMENDED IN SENATE MARCH 22, 2023

# SENATE BILL No. 537

## **Introduced by Senator Becker**

February 14, 2023

An act to amend Section 54953 of, and to add Section 54953.4 to, the Government Code, relating to local-government. government, and declaring the urgency thereof, to take effect immediately.

#### LEGISLATIVE COUNSEL'S DIGEST

SB 537, as amended, Becker. Open meetings: local agencies: teleconferences.

Existing law, the Ralph M. Brown Act, requires, with specified exceptions, that all meetings of a legislative body, as defined, of a local agency be open and public and that all persons be permitted to attend and participate. The act generally requires for teleconferencing that the legislative body of a local agency that elects to use teleconferencing post agendas at all teleconference locations, identify each teleconference location in the notice and agenda of the meeting or proceeding, and have each teleconference location be accessible to the public. Existing law also requires that, during the teleconference, at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body participate from locations within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction. The act provides an exemption to the jurisdictional requirement for health authorities, as defined.

Existing law, until January 1, 2024, authorizes the legislative body of a local agency to use alternate teleconferencing provisions during a proclaimed state of emergency or in other situations related to public health that exempt a legislative body from the general requirements (emergency provisions) and impose different requirements for notice,

 $SB 537 \qquad \qquad -2-$ 

agenda, and public participation, as prescribed. The emergency provisions specify that they do not require a legislative body to provide a physical location from which the public may attend or comment.

Existing law, until January 1, 2026, authorizes the legislative body of a local agency to use alternative teleconferencing in certain circumstances related to the particular member if at least a quorum of its members participate from a singular physical location that is open to the public and situated within the agency's jurisdiction and other requirements are met, including restrictions on remote participation by a member of the legislative body. These circumstances include if a member shows "just cause," including for a childcare or caregiving need of a relative that requires the member to participate remotely.

This bill would authorize certain legislative bodies to use alternate teleconferencing provisions similar to the emergency provisions indefinitely and without regard to a state of emergency. The bill would also require a legislative body to provide a record of attendance on its internet website within 7 days after a teleconference meeting, as specified. The bill would define "legislative body" for this purpose to mean a board, commission, or advisory body of a multijurisdictional cross county agency, the membership of which board, commission, or advisory body is appointed and which board, commission, or advisory body is otherwise subject to the act. The bill would also define "multijurisdictional" to mean a legislative body that includes representatives from more than one county, city, city and county, special district, or a joint powers entity.

With respect to the alternative teleconferencing provisions operative until January 1, 2026, the bill would expand the circumstances of "just cause" to apply to the situation in which an immunocompromised child, parent, grandparent, or other specified relative requires the member to participate remotely.

Existing constitutional provisions require that a statute that limits the right of access to the meetings of public bodies or the writings of public officials and agencies be adopted with findings demonstrating the interest protected by the limitation and the need for protecting that interest.

This bill would make legislative findings to that effect.

The California Constitution requires local agencies, for the purpose of ensuring public access to the meetings of public bodies and the writings of public officials and agencies, to comply with a statutory enactment that amends or enacts laws relating to public records or -3- SB 537

open meetings and contains findings demonstrating that the enactment furthers the constitutional requirements relating to this purpose.

This bill would make legislative findings to that effect.

This bill would declare that it is to take effect immediately as an urgency statute.

Existing law, the Ralph M. Brown Act, requires, with specified exceptions, that all meetings of a legislative body of a local agency, as those terms are defined, be open and public and that all persons be permitted to attend and participate. The act contains specified provisions regarding providing for the ability of the public to observe and provide comment. The act allows for meetings to occur through teleconference, subject to specified requirements.

This bill would state the intent of the Legislature to enact subsequent legislation that expands local government's access to hold public meetings through teleconferencing and remote access.

Vote: majority <sup>2</sup>/<sub>3</sub>. Appropriation: no. Fiscal committee: no. State-mandated local program: no.

The people of the State of California do enact as follows:

1 SECTION 1. Section 54953 of the Government Code, as 2 amended by Section 2 of Chapter 285 of the Statutes of 2022, is 3 amended to read:

4 5

7

8

9 10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

54953. (a) All meetings of the legislative body of a local agency shall be open and public, and all persons shall be permitted to attend any meeting of the legislative body of a local agency, except as otherwise provided in this chapter.

- (b) (1) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, the legislative body of a local agency may use teleconferencing for the benefit of the public and the legislative body of a local agency in connection with any meeting or proceeding authorized by law. The teleconferenced meeting or proceeding shall comply with all otherwise applicable requirements of this chapter and all otherwise applicable provisions of law relating to a specific type of meeting or proceeding.
- (2) Teleconferencing, as authorized by this section, may be used for all purposes in connection with any meeting within the subject matter jurisdiction of the legislative body. If the legislative body of a local agency elects to use teleconferencing, the legislative body of a local agency shall comply with all of the following:

SB 537 —4—

1 (A) All votes taken during a teleconferenced meeting shall be 2 by rollcall.

- (B) The teleconferenced meetings shall be conducted in a manner that protects the statutory and constitutional rights of the parties or the public appearing before the legislative body of a local agency.
- (C) The legislative body shall give notice of the meeting and post agendas as otherwise required by this chapter.
- (D) The legislative body shall allow members of the public to access the meeting and the agenda shall provide an opportunity for members of the public to address the legislative body directly pursuant to Section 54954.3.
- (3) If the legislative body of a local agency elects to use teleconferencing, it shall post agendas at all teleconference locations. Each teleconference location shall be identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting or proceeding, and each teleconference location shall be accessible to the public. During the teleconference, at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body shall participate from locations within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction, except as provided in subdivision (d).
- (c) (1) No legislative body shall take action by secret ballot, whether preliminary or final.
- (2) The legislative body of a local agency shall publicly report any action taken and the vote or abstention on that action of each member present for the action.
- (3) Prior to taking final action, the legislative body shall orally report a summary of a recommendation for a final action on the salaries, salary schedules, or compensation paid in the form of fringe benefits of a local agency executive, as defined in subdivision (d) of Section 3511.1, during the open meeting in which the final action is to be taken. This paragraph shall not affect the public's right under the California Public Records Act (Division 10 (commencing with Section 7920.000) of Title 1) to inspect or copy records created or received in the process of developing the recommendation.
- (d) (1) Notwithstanding the provisions relating to a quorum in paragraph (3) of subdivision (b), if a health authority conducts a teleconference meeting, members who are outside the jurisdiction of the authority may be counted toward the establishment of a

\_5\_ SB 537

quorum when participating in the teleconference if at least 50 percent of the number of members that would establish a quorum are present within the boundaries of the territory over which the authority exercises jurisdiction, and the health authority provides a teleconference number, and associated access codes, if any, that allows any person to call in to participate in the meeting and the number and access codes are identified in the notice and agenda of the meeting.

- (2) Nothing in this subdivision shall be construed as discouraging health authority members from regularly meeting at a common physical site within the jurisdiction of the authority or from using teleconference locations within or near the jurisdiction of the authority. A teleconference meeting for which a quorum is established pursuant to this subdivision shall be subject to all other requirements of this section.
- (3) For purposes of this subdivision, a health authority means any entity created pursuant to Sections 14018.7, 14087.31, 14087.35, 14087.36, 14087.38, and 14087.9605 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, any joint powers authority created pursuant to Article 1 (commencing with Section 6500) of Chapter 5 of Division 7 for the purpose of contracting pursuant to Section 14087.3 of the Welfare and Institutions Code, and any advisory committee to a county-sponsored health plan licensed pursuant to Chapter 2.2 (commencing with Section 1340) of Division 2 of the Health and Safety Code if the advisory committee has 12 or more members.
- (e) (1) The legislative body of a local agency may use teleconferencing without complying with paragraph (3) of subdivision (b) if, during the teleconference meeting, at least a quorum of the members of the legislative body participates in person from a singular physical location clearly identified on the agenda, which location shall be open to the public and situated within the boundaries of the territory over which the local agency exercises jurisdiction and the legislative body complies with all of the following:
- (A) The legislative body shall provide at least one of the following as a means by which the public may remotely hear and visually observe the meeting, and remotely address the legislative body:
  - (i) A two-way audiovisual platform.

-6-**SB 537** 

1

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24 25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

(ii) A two-way telephonic service and a live webcasting of the 2 meeting. 3

- (B) In each instance in which notice of the time of the teleconferenced meeting is otherwise given or the agenda for the meeting is otherwise posted, the legislative body shall also give notice of the means by which members of the public may access the meeting and offer public comment.
- (C) The agenda shall identify and include an opportunity for all persons to attend and address the legislative body directly pursuant to Section 54954.3 via a call-in option, via an internet-based service option, and at the in-person location of the meeting.
- (D) In the event of a disruption that prevents the legislative body from broadcasting the meeting to members of the public using the call-in option or internet-based service option, or in the event of a disruption within the local agency's control that prevents members of the public from offering public comments using the call-in option or internet-based service option, the legislative body shall take no further action on items appearing on the meeting agenda until public access to the meeting via the call-in option or internet-based service option is restored. Actions taken on agenda items during a disruption that prevents the legislative body from broadcasting the meeting may be challenged pursuant to Section 54960.1.
- (E) The legislative body shall not require public comments to be submitted in advance of the meeting and must provide an opportunity for the public to address the legislative body and offer comment in real time.
- (F) Notwithstanding Section 54953.3, an individual desiring to provide public comment through the use of an internet website, or other online platform, not under the control of the local legislative body, that requires registration to log in to a teleconference may be required to register as required by the third-party internet website or online platform to participate.
- (2) A member of the legislative body shall only participate in the meeting remotely pursuant to this subdivision, if all of the following requirements are met:
  - (A) One of the following circumstances applies:
- (i) The member notifies the legislative body at the earliest opportunity possible, including at the start of a regular meeting, of their need to participate remotely for just cause, including a

\_7\_ SB 537

general description of the circumstances relating to their need to appear remotely at the given meeting. The provisions of this clause shall not be used by any member of the legislative body for more than two meetings per calendar year.

- (ii) The member requests the legislative body to allow them to participate in the meeting remotely due to emergency circumstances and the legislative body takes action to approve the request. The legislative body shall request a general description of the circumstances relating to their need to appear remotely at the given meeting. A general description of an item generally need not exceed 20 words and shall not require the member to disclose any medical diagnosis or disability, or any personal medical information that is already exempt under existing law, such as the Confidentiality of Medical Information Act (Chapter 1 (commencing with Section 56) of Part 2.6 of Division 1 of the Civil Code). For the purposes of this clause, the following requirements apply:
- (I) A member shall make a request to participate remotely at a meeting pursuant to this clause as soon as possible. The member shall make a separate request for each meeting in which they seek to participate remotely.
- (II) The legislative body may take action on a request to participate remotely at the earliest opportunity. If the request does not allow sufficient time to place proposed action on such a request on the posted agenda for the meeting for which the request is made, the legislative body may take action at the beginning of the meeting in accordance with paragraph (4) of subdivision (b) of Section 54954.2.
- (B) The member shall publicly disclose at the meeting before any action is taken whether any other individuals 18 years of age or older are present in the room at the remote location with the member, and the general nature of the member's relationship with any such individuals.
- (C) The member shall participate through both audio and visual technology.
- (3) The provisions of this subdivision shall not serve as a means for any member of a legislative body to participate in meetings of the legislative body solely by teleconference from a remote location for a period of more than three consecutive months or 20 percent of the regular meetings for the local agency within a calendar year,

SB 537 —8—

or more than two meetings if the legislative body regularly meets fewer than 10 times per calendar year.

- (f) The legislative body shall have and implement a procedure for receiving and swiftly resolving requests for reasonable accommodation for individuals with disabilities, consistent with the federal Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 (42 U.S.C. Sec. 12132), and resolving any doubt in favor of accessibility. In each instance in which notice of the time of the meeting is otherwise given or the agenda for the meeting is otherwise posted, the legislative body shall also give notice of the procedure for receiving and resolving requests for accommodation.
- (g) The legislative body shall conduct meetings subject to this chapter consistent with applicable civil rights and nondiscrimination laws.
- (h) (1) Nothing in this section shall prohibit a legislative body from providing the public with additional teleconference locations.
- (2) Nothing in this section shall prohibit a legislative body from providing members of the public with additional physical locations in which the public may observe and address the legislative body by electronic means.
- (i) For the purposes of this section, the following definitions shall apply:
- (1) "Emergency circumstances" means a physical or family medical emergency that prevents a member from attending in person.
  - (2) "Just cause" means any of the following:
- (A) A childcare or caregiving need of a child, parent, grandparent, grandchild, sibling, spouse, or domestic partner that requires them to participate remotely. "Child," "parent," "grandparent," "grandchild," and "sibling" have the same meaning as those terms do in Section 12945.2.
- (B) A contagious illness that prevents a member from attending in person.
- 34 (C) A need related to a physical or mental disability as defined 35 in Sections 12926 and 12926.1 not otherwise accommodated by 36 subdivision (f).
- 37 (D) Travel while on official business of the legislative body or 38 another state or local agency.

\_9\_ SB 537

(E) An immunocompromised child, parent, grandparent, grandchild, sibling, spouse, or domestic partner that requires them to participate remotely.

- (3) "Remote location" means a location from which a member of a legislative body participates in a meeting pursuant to subdivision (e), other than any physical meeting location designated in the notice of the meeting. Remote locations need not be accessible to the public.
- (4) "Remote participation" means participation in a meeting by teleconference at a location other than any physical meeting location designated in the notice of the meeting. Watching or listening to a meeting via webcasting or another similar electronic medium that does not permit members to interactively hear, discuss, or deliberate on matters, does not constitute remote participation.
- (5) "Teleconference" means a meeting of a legislative body, the members of which are in different locations, connected by electronic means, through either audio or video, or both.
- (6) "Two-way audiovisual platform" means an online platform that provides participants with the ability to participate in a meeting via both an interactive video conference and a two-way telephonic function.
- (7) "Two-way telephonic service" means a telephone service that does not require internet access, is not provided as part of a two-way audiovisual platform, and allows participants to dial a telephone number to listen and verbally participate.
- (8) "Webcasting" means a streaming video broadcast online or on television, using streaming media technology to distribute a single content source to many simultaneous listeners and viewers.
- (j) This section shall become operative January 1, 2024, shall remain in effect only until January 1, 2026, and as of that date is repealed.
- 33 SEC. 2. Section 54953.4 is added to the Government Code, to 34 read:
  - 54953.4. (a) (1) A legislative body included in subdivision (c) may use teleconferencing without complying with paragraph (3) of subdivision (b) of Section 54953 if the legislative body complies with paragraph (2) of this section.
- 39 (2) A legislative body that holds a meeting pursuant to this 40 subdivision shall do all of the following:

SB 537 -10-

(A) In each instance in which notice of the time of the teleconferenced meeting is otherwise given or the agenda for the meeting is otherwise posted, the legislative body shall also give notice of the means by which members of the public may access the meeting and offer public comment. The agenda shall identify and include an opportunity for all persons to attend via a call-in option or an internet-based service option.

- (B) In the event of a disruption that prevents the legislative body from broadcasting the meeting to members of the public using the call-in option or internet-based service option, or in the event of a disruption within the local agency's control that prevents members of the public from offering public comments using the call-in option or internet-based service option, the legislative body shall take no further action on items appearing on the meeting agenda until public access to the meeting via the call-in option or internet-based service option is restored. Actions taken on agenda items during a disruption that prevents the legislative body from broadcasting the meeting may be challenged pursuant to Section 54960.1.
- (C) The legislative body shall not require public comments to be submitted in advance of the meeting and shall provide an opportunity for the public to address the legislative body and offer comment in real time.
- (D) Notwithstanding Section 54953.3, an individual desiring to provide public comment through the use of an internet website, or other online platform, not under the control of the legislative body, that requires registration to log in to a teleconference may be required to register as required by the third-party internet website or online platform to participate.
- (E) (i) A legislative body that provides a timed public comment period for each agenda item shall not close the public comment period for the agenda item, or the opportunity to register, pursuant to subparagraph (D), to provide public comment until that timed public comment period has elapsed.
- (ii) A legislative body that does not provide a timed public comment period, but takes public comment separately on each agenda item, shall allow a reasonable amount of time per agenda item to allow public members the opportunity to provide public comment, including time for members of the public to register

—11— SB 537

pursuant to subparagraph (D), or otherwise be recognized for the purpose of providing public comment.

- (iii) A legislative body that provides a timed general public comment period that does not correspond to a specific agenda item shall not close the public comment period or the opportunity to register, pursuant to subparagraph (D), until the timed general public comment period has elapsed.
- (F) Except as provided in Section 54953.3, a legislative body shall provide a record of attendance of both community members, and legislative body seven days after a teleconference meeting on its internet website. The legislative body shall also note on its website the number of public comments in the previous meeting within seven days.
- (3) This subdivision shall not be construed to require the legislative body to provide a physical location from which the public may attend or comment.
- (b) The legislative body shall comply with all other requirements of Section 54953.
- (c) As used in this section, "legislative body" means a board, commission, or advisory body of a multijurisdictional, cross county agency, the membership of which board, commission, or advisory body is appointed and which board, commission, or advisory body is otherwise subject to this chapter. As used in this subdivision, "multijurisdictional" means a legislative body that includes representatives from more than one county, city, city and county, special district, or a joint powers entity formed pursuant to Article 1 (commencing with Section 6500) of Chapter 5 of Division 7 of Title 1.
- SEC. 3. The Legislature finds and declares that Sections 1 and 2 of this act, which amend Section 54953 of, and add Section 54953.4 to, the Government Code, impose a limitation on the public's right of access to the meetings of public bodies or the writings of public officials and agencies within the meaning of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution. Pursuant to that constitutional provision, the Legislature makes the following findings to demonstrate the interest protected by this limitation and the need for protecting that interest:
- Permitting remote participation for just cause due to a member's immunocompromised family member, as well as extending the operation of teleconferencing for legislative bodies of

SB 537 -12-

multijurisdictional, cross county agencies with appointed membership, will further increase public participation, increase the pool of people who are able to serve on these bodies, and protect the health and safety of the public.

SEC. 4. The Legislature finds and declares that Sections 1 and 2 of this act, which amend Section 54953 of, and add Section 54953.4 to, the Government Code, further, within the meaning of paragraph (7) of subdivision (b) of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution, the purposes of that constitutional section as it relates to the right of public access to the meetings of local public bodies or the writings of local public officials and local agencies. Pursuant to paragraph (7) of subdivision (b) of Section 3 of Article I of the California Constitution, the Legislature makes the following findings:

Permitting remote participation for just cause due to a member's immunocompromised family member, as well as extending the operation of teleconferencing for legislative bodies of multijurisdictional, cross county agencies with appointed membership, will further increase public participation, increase the pool of people who are able to serve on these bodies, and protect the health and safety of the public.

SEC. 5. This act is an urgency statute necessary for the immediate preservation of the public peace, health, or safety within the meaning of Article IV of the California Constitution and shall go into immediate effect. The facts constituting the necessity are:

Virtual meetings have allowed much easier access to appointed bodies of local agencies with far more members of the public participating in each meeting. This has created greater equity in the process and fostered the health of our democracy. In-person meetings may jeopardize the health and safety of vulnerable citizens due to ongoing risks of illnesses.

SECTION 1. It is the intent of the Legislature to enact subsequent legislation that expands local government's access to hold public meetings through teleconferencing and remote access.