



2021-01

GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE, HIGHWAY AND TRANSPORTATION DISTRICT

MEMORANDUM OF MINUTES

BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING

JANUARY 22, 2021

Executive Order N-25-20 and N-29-20, issued by the Governor of the State of California, in which portions of the Ralph M. Brown Act are suspended and allows, all Board members, staff and the public to participate by telephone.

These minutes are supplemented by the audio recording that is posted online at:
<https://www.goldengate.org/district/board-of-directors/meeting-documents>.

The Board of Directors (Board) of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District (District) met in regular session via audio conference, on Friday January 22, 2021, at 10:00 a.m., President Pahre presiding.

ADMINISTER OATHS OF OFFICE [00:31 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]

At the beginning of the Board meeting, Secretary of the District Amorette Ko-Wong administered the Oath of Office to Chris Snyder, appointed to the District's Board by the Board of Supervisors of Sonoma County, on December 15, 2020 and effective January 1, 2021. Director Snyder expressed his appreciation for the welcome from the Board.

Ms. Ko-Wong also administered the Oath of Office to Dennis Rodoni, who was appointed to the District's Board by the Board of Supervisors of Marin County, on January 12, 2021. Director Rodoni said he was pleased to join the Board and he expressed his appreciation for the welcome from the Board members.

- (1) CALL TO ORDER:** President Barbara L. Pahre.
- (2) ROLL CALL:** Secretary of the District Amorette M. Ko-Wong. **[8:08 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]**

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
JANUARY 22, 2021/PAGE 2**

Directors Present (13): Directors Arnold, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hernández, Hill, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Rodoni and Snyder; Second Vice President Cochran; First Vice President Theriault; President Pahre.

Director Absent (2): Directors Grosboll and Stefani.

[Note: On this date, there were four vacancies on the Board of Directors.]

Staff Present: General Manager Denis Mulligan; Auditor-Controller Joseph Wire; District Engineer Ewa Bauer-Furbush; Secretary of the District Amorette Ko-Wong; Attorneys Madeline Chun and Kimon Manolius; Deputy General Manager/Administration and Development Kellee Hopper; Deputy General Manager/Bridge Steve Miller; Deputy General Manager/Bus Division Mona Babauta; Deputy General Manager/Ferry Division James Swindler; Executive Administrator to the General Manager Justine Bock; Senior Board Analyst Elizabeth Eells.

- (3) **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:** Director Bert Hill. **[10:40 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]**

Copies of all reports are available on the District's web site at <https://www.goldengate.org/district/board-of-directors/meeting-documents> or upon request from the Office of the District Secretary.

- (4) **PUBLIC COMMENT:** **[11:23 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]**

Ms. Ko-Wong stated that the Board would take public comment for all items on the agenda at this time. President Pahre requested that the speakers keep their comments to three minutes each.

The following individuals spoke under public comment:

- Kymberlyrenee Gamboa, Sacramento County Resident
- David Rhody, The Climate Reality Project
- David Pilpel, San Francisco County Resident
- Shane Weinstein, Amalgamated Transit Union (ATU), Local 1575
- John Holden, Bus Operator
- Barrett Young, County of Sonoma Resident and Retired Bus Operator
- Frank Gleason, Bus Operator
- David Herrera, Bus Operator

[30:35 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]

At the conclusion of Agenda Item No. 4, President Pahre proposed that the Board consider the Special Order of Business Agenda Item Nos. 10.A through 10.E out of order.

Directors GARBARINO/FREDERICKS moved and seconded to take Agenda Item Nos. 10.A through 10.E out of order.

Carried

- (5) **SPECIAL ORDER OF BUSINESS:**

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
JANUARY 22, 2021/PAGE 3**

- (A) **Authorize a Resolution of Appreciation to Gina Belforte in Recognition of her Dedicated Service as Director of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District Board** [31:45 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]

Former Director Belforte spoke about her love of the Bridge and how much she appreciated serving on the Board. She expressed her appreciation for the Board and staff. She also spoke about what an honor it was to make decisions on the Board. She expressed her appreciation for those who advocated for the Suicide Deterrent System (SDS).

Directors Cochran, Rabbitt and Theriault, and President Pahre expressed their appreciation to former Director Belforte, and wished her well.

Directors COCHRAN/ARNOLD

Resolution No. 2021-001 authorizes a Resolution of Appreciation to Gina Belforte in Recognition of her Dedicated Service as Director of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District Board.

Adopted

AYES (12): Directors Arnold, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hernández, Hill, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt and Snyder; Second Vice President Cochran; First Vice President Theriault; President Pahre.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (3): Directors Grosboll, Rodoni and Stefani.

- (B) **Authorize a Resolution of Appreciation to Sandra Lee Fewer in Recognition of her Dedicated Service as Director of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District Board** [40:50 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]

Former Director Fewer expressed her regret for her abrupt departure from the Board. She said it had been a pleasure serving on the Board. She expressed her appreciation for the Board, staff and District. She spoke about the iconic status of the Bridge.

Director Hill and President Pahre expressed their appreciation to former Director Fewer, and wished her well.

Directors HILL/COCHRAN

Resolution No. 2021-002 authorizes a Resolution of Appreciation to Sandra Lee Fewer in Recognition of her Dedicated Service as Director of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District Board.

Adopted

AYES (12): Directors Arnold, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hernández, Hill, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, and Snyder; Second Vice President Cochran; First Vice President Theriault; President Pahre.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (3): Directors Grosboll, Rodoni, and Stefani.

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
JANUARY 22, 2021/PAGE 4**

[Director Rodoni arrived]

- (C) Authorize a Resolution of Appreciation to Kathrin Sears in Recognition of her Dedicated Service as Director of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District Board [51:01 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]**

Former Director Sears said she has a special connection to the Bridge and she expressed her appreciation for serving on the Board. She expressed her appreciation for Board members, staff and members of the public like the Gamboa family who advocated for the SDS. She expressed her confidence in new Director Rodoni and wished the Board well.

Directors Theriault, Garbarino, Fredericks and Rodoni, and President Pahre expressed their appreciation for former Director Sears, and wished her well. Director Fredericks highlighted some of the Board's accomplishments during former Director Sears' tenure.

Directors FREDERICKS/ARNOLD

Resolution No. 2021-003 authorizes a Resolution of Appreciation to Kathrin Sears in Recognition of her Dedicated Service as Director of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District Board.

Adopted

AYES (13): Directors Arnold, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hernández, Hill, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Rodoni and Snyder; Second Vice President Cochran; First Vice President Theriault; President Pahre.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (2): Directors Grosboll and Stefani.

- (D) Authorize a Resolution of Appreciation to Brian Sobel in Recognition of his Dedicated Service as Director of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District Board [1:04:28 Hours Mark on the Audio Recording]**

Former Director Sobel expressed his appreciation for Board members with whom he had served, staff and members of the public like the Gamboa and James families who advocated for the SDS. He spoke about some of the projects the Board approved and oversaw during his tenure. In addition, he spoke about the Bridge's iconic status around the world and expressed his appreciation for the opportunity to serve on the Board.

Directors Garbarino, Fredericks, Moylan, Rabbitt and Snyder, and President Pahre expressed their appreciation for former Director Sobel, and wished him well. Director Garbarino acknowledged the time he took to speak to members of the public. Director Fredericks spoke about his contributions when it came to financial matters. President Pahre expressed her appreciation for his level head, compassion, fairness, courage and humor.

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
JANUARY 22, 2021/PAGE 5**

Ms. Ko-Wong spoke about the role former Director Sobel played as Chair of the All-Electronic Tolling Advisory Committee.

Directors GARBARINO/MOYLAN

Resolution No. 2021-004 authorizes a Resolution of Appreciation to Brian Sobel in Recognition of his Dedicated Service as Director of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District Board.

Adopted

AYES (13): Directors Arnold, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hernández, Hill, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Rodoni and Snyder; Second Vice President Cochran; First Vice President Theriault; President Pahre.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (2): Directors Grosboll and Stefani.

(E) Authorize a Resolution of Appreciation to Norman Yee in Recognition of his Dedicated Service as Director of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District Board [1:20:58 Hours Mark on the Audio Recording]

President Pahre stated that former Director Yee was not able to attend the meeting. At his request, she conveyed that he enjoyed his service on the Board and appreciated staff's contribution and the spirited discussions.

Directors Theriault, Hill and Moylan expressed their appreciation for former Director Yee, and wished him well. Director Theriault spoke about his honest and thoughtful approach to issues, and follow through. Director Hill spoke about former Director Yee's commitment to the Board. President Pahre spoke about his commitment and conscientiousness.

Directors HILL/MOYLAN

Resolution No. 2021-005 authorizes a Resolution of Appreciation to Norman Yee in Recognition of his Dedicated Service as Director of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District Board.

Adopted

AYES (13): Directors Arnold, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hernández, Hill, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Rodoni and Snyder; Second Vice President Cochran; First Vice President Theriault; President Pahre.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (2): Directors Grosboll and Stefani.

At the conclusion of Agenda Item No. 10.E, President Pahre welcomed the Directors to 2021 and expressed her hope the Board would dialogue and work well together as the Board encounters obstacles.

(6) CONSENT CALENDAR: [1:27:09 Hours Mark on the Audio Recording]

Secretary of the District Amorette Ko-Wong presented the Consent Calendar.

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
JANUARY 22, 2021/PAGE 6**

Directors COCHRAN/MOYLAN moved and seconded to approve the Consent Calendar. All items were approved by the following vote of the Board of Directors:

AYES (12): Directors Arnold, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hernández, Hill, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt and Snyder; Second Vice President Cochran; First Vice President Theriault; President Pahre.
NOES (0): None.
ABSTENTION (1): Director Rodoni.
ABSENT (2): Directors Grosboll and Stefani.

(A) Approve the Minutes of the following Meetings

- (1) Finance-Auditing Committee of November 19, 2020;
- (2) Board of Directors of November 20, 2020;
- (3) Finance-Auditing Committee of December 17, 2020;
- (4) Governmental Affairs and Public Relations Committee of December 18, 2020;
- (5) Board of Directors of December 18, 2020; and
- (6) Special Board of Directors of December 23, 2020.

Carried

(B) Ratification of Previous Actions by the Auditor-Controller

Resolution No. 2021-006 (as detailed in the January 21, 2021 Finance-Auditing Committee meeting)

- (1) Ratifies Commitments and/or Expenditures
- (2) Ratifies Previous Investments
- (3) Authorizes Reinvestments
- (4) Accepts Investment Report for December 2020

Adopted

(7) REPORTS OF OFFICERS:

(A) General Manager [1:28:59 Hours Mark on the Audio Recording]

Mr. Mulligan presented the General Manager's Report, which was for informational purposes and no action was required. He noted Bridge Security staff had stopped 185 people from jumping off the Bridge. He expressed his appreciation for the suicide prevention efforts of staff and the District partners. He said the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) would meet on January 27, 2021 to approve the first tranche of *Coronavirus Response and Relief Supplemental Appropriations Act of 2021 (CRRSAA)* funding, and MTC staff has recommended the agency allocate \$20.3 million to the District in the first tranche.

He recognized the following employees and Director for their service to the District: Barbara J. Vincent, David A. Rivera, Joseph C. Gallow, III, Patricia Gray, Steven Safford, David A. Rabbitt and Jose Hernandez.

President Pahre expressed her appreciation for those people who were recognized for their service to the District.

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
JANUARY 22, 2021/PAGE 7**

(B) Attorney [1:38:35 Hours Mark on the Audio Recording]

Attorney Kimon Manolius presented the Attorney's Report, which was for informational purposes only and no action was required.

(1) Closed Session

Attorney Manolius reported that the attorneys had a Closed Session item, listed on the Board Agenda as Item No. (6)(B)(1):

**(a) Conference with Legal Counsel – Existing Litigation
Pursuant to Government Code Section 54956.9(a)
Report of Hanson Bridgett, LLP**

- (i) Michael Saliani v. Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District, San Francisco Superior Court; Case Number CGC-14-540384.**

Attorney Manolius stated the Saliani matter report would take about 30 minutes. He asked if the President would like the attorneys to present the report at a future meeting in light of the length of other items on the agenda.

President Pahre said that towards the end of the meeting, she would ask the Board to consider whether or not to delay the report.

(C) District Engineer [1:39:27 Hours Mark on the Audio Recording]

Ms. Bauer-Furbush presented the District Engineer's Report, which was for informational purposes only and no action was taken. She provided a status update on a number of projects.

(8) OTHER REPORTS:

There were no "Other Reports" to discuss.

(9) REPORT OF COMMITTEES:

**(A) Meeting of the Building and Operating Committee/Committee of the Whole
[1:44:05 Hours Mark on the Audio Recording]
January 21, 2021
Chair Michael Theriault**

- (1) Authorize Amendments to Professional Services Agreement Nos. 2014-B-7, 2014-B-8 and 2014-B-9, Golden Gate Bridge Seismic Retrofit Phase IIIB Technical Review Panel Member Services [1:44:19 Hours Mark on the Audio Recording]**

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
JANUARY 22, 2021/PAGE 8**

Directors THERIAULT/COCHRAN

Resolution No. 2021-007 authorizes execution of the Sixth Amendment to the Professional Services Agreement execution of the following Amendments to Professional Services Agreement (PSA) Nos. 2014-B-7, 2014-B-8 and 2014-B-9, *Golden Gate Bridge Seismic Retrofit Project Phase IIIB Technical Review Panel Member Services*:

- (a) Sixth Amendment to PSA No. 2014-B-7 with Mr. Michel Bruneau, P.E., Ph.D., in an amount not to exceed \$100,000;
- (b) Sixth Amendment to PSA No. 2014-B-8 with Mr. Karl H. Frank, P.E., Ph.D., in an amount not to exceed \$100,000; and,
- (c) Sixth Amendment to PSA No. 2014-B-9 with Mr. David J. Nash, P.E., in an amount not to exceed \$100,000;

to continue providing technical review services of the *Golden Gate Bridge Seismic Retrofit Phase IIIB Project* design through the Construction Manager/General Contractor (CMGC) preconstruction phase of the Project, with the understanding that sufficient funds to finance these Amendments to the PSAs are available in the budget for the *Golden Gate Bridge Seismic Phase IIIB CMGC Project* (Project #1923).

Adopted

AYES (13): Directors Arnold, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hernández, Hill, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Rodoni and Snyder; Second Vice President Cochran; First Vice President Theriault; President Pahre.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (2): Directors Grosboll and Stefani.

**(B) Meeting of the Finance-Auditing Committee/Committee of the Whole [1:46:56
Hours Mark on the Audio Recording]**

January 21, 2021

Chair David Rabbitt

Chair Rabbitt requested that staff report to the Board and answer questions raised at the Finance-Auditing Committee meeting of the day before. Mr. Mulligan reported that the software program referred to in the staff report would automate certain tasks and allow Bus Operators to accept their work assignments through their cell phones. He stated that the change would not affect any of staff's working conditions, staff has met with the union to discuss the change, and the union does not have any objections.

President Pahre and Director Hernández expressed their appreciation to staff for responding to the questions of the day before. Director Hernández stated that she believes it is important to stay in communication with the labor unions.

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
JANUARY 22, 2021/PAGE 9**

- (1) **Budget Increase in the FY 20/21 District Division Capital and Operating Budgets Relative to Capital Project 1712, *Transit Scheduling System***
[11:50 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]

Directors RABBITT/HERNÁNDEZ

Resolution No. 2021-008 authorizes a budget increase in the FY 20/21 District Division Capital and Operating Budgets in the amount of \$520,000, relative to Capital Project No. 1712, *Transit Scheduling System*, for a total project cost of \$3,564,966.

Adopted

AYES (13): Directors Arnold, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hernández, Hill, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Rodoni and Snyder; Second Vice President Cochran; First Vice President Theriault; President Pahre.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (2): Directors Grosboll and Stefani.

- (2) **Approve Actions Relative to Clipper 2.0 System Integration with Computer Aided Dispatch/Automatic Vehicle Location (CAD/AVL) System** **[1:52:36 Hours Mark on the Audio Recording]**

Director Mastin stated that the day before, he had asked a question about the software maintenance costs. He asked if staff had obtained an answer to his question.

Mr. Mulligan responded to the Director's inquiry.

Directors RABBITT/FREDERICKS

Resolution No. 2021-009 approves actions relative to the Clipper 2.0 System Integration with Computer Aided Dispatch/Automatic Vehicle Location (CAD/AVL) System as follows:

- (a) Establishes a new capital project, CAD/AVL Clipper Integration (Project #2114), for the Clipper 2.0 System Integration with CAD/AVL System, with a budget total of \$938,620. This amount comprises the Prime Contract, one-year of software maintenance, project management support, and a project contingency as discussed below;
- (b) Authorizes the General Manager to execute a Professional Services Agreement with INIT Innovations in Transportation, Inc. (INIT), Chesapeake, VA, relative to Contract No. 2020-D-063, *Clipper 2.0 System Integration with CAD/AVL System*, in the amount of \$787,119.34 (the "Prime Contract"). Under this agreement, INIT will provide the integration for the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District's CAD/AVL hardware and software system with the Regional Clipper program, managed by the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC), and administered by Cubic Transportation systems; and,

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
JANUARY 22, 2021/PAGE 10**

- (c) Authorizes the General Manager to execute the First Amendment to Contract No. 2019-D-009, *Software Maintenance for INIT Software*, with INIT, in the amount of \$17,664 for one-year software maintenance after the one-year warranty.

Adopted

AYES (13): Directors Arnold, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hernández, Hill, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Rodoni and Snyder; Second Vice President Cochran; First Vice President Theriault; President Pahre.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (2): Directors Grosboll and Stefani.

(10) ADDRESSES TO BOARD:

There were no “Addresses to Board” to discuss.

(11) SPECIAL ORDER OF BUSINESS:

- (F) **Ratify Appointments by the Board President to Represent the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District on Other Boards** [1:56:15 Hours Mark on the Audio Recording]

Directors Cochran/Moylan moved and seconded the President’s appointments to other Boards as outlined in the staff report.

Directors Theriault/Hernández moved and seconded to divide the question and take former Director Sobel’s appointment to the Amalgamated Transit Health and Welfare Trust and Retirement Board (Retirement Board) under separate consideration.

President Pahre asked if Directors had any questions or comments about the motion. Director Theriault responded that he believed that a motion to amend is not debatable. He stated that he thought it was an up or down vote.

President Pahre asked Attorney Manolius to comment on Director Theriault’s assertion. Attorney Manolius stated that he understood that Director Theriault had made a motion to sever former Director Sobel’s appointment from the original recommendation. He said one could take the position that the motion is not debatable. He said that the President could ask Directors Cochran and Moylan if they were amenable to the amendment. Directors Cochran and Moylan stated that they were not willing to accept an amendment to their original recommendation.

President Pahre asked if their refusal stops the amendment. Attorney Manolius responded that the motion to amend has to be considered first.

President Pahre stated that she does not have to allow Board members to comment on the proposed amendment. Attorney Manolius responded the Board has had a

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
JANUARY 22, 2021/PAGE 11**

history of allowing its members to speak, but noted the President does not have to allow the Directors to comment on the amendment.

Director Arnold asked for clarity about the amendment. President Pahre stated that the Board will be voting on a proposed amendment to sever former Director Sobel's name from the original recommendation. Director Theriault clarified that he made a motion to consider former Director Sobel's appointment separately from the other appointments. He noted that *Robert's Rules of Order* states a motion to amend is not debatable. President Pahre stated that there would be no debate on this motion.

Mr. Mulligan asked if Director Theriault would like to state his preference for which one is voted upon first. Director Theriault responded that he leaves the order to the discretion of the President.

Motion to Amend the Recommendation

Directors THERIAULT/HERNÁNDEZ moved and seconded to divide the question and take former Director Sobel's appointment to the Amalgamated Transit Health and Welfare Trust and Retirement Board (Retirement Board) under separate consideration.

Failed

AYES (6): Directors Hernández, Hill, Mastin, Rodoni and Snyder; First Vice President Theriault.

NOES (7): Directors Arnold, Fredericks, Garbarino, Moylan, Rabbitt; Second Vice President Cochran; President Pahre.

ABSENT (2): Directors Grosboll and Stefani.

President Pahre stated the failed motion meant the Board would consider the original recommendation. She restated the recommendation as outlined in the staff report.

Director Rodoni requested clarification on the rationale for appointing a non-Board member to another Board. President Pahre responded that the appointments to the other Boards are the President's purview and she choose to appoint former Director Sobel. She noted the Board has appointed a former Board member to serve on other Boards in the past. She said she believes former Director Sobel is qualified, and he would serve the Board and employees well. Mr. Mulligan added that in the *Rules of the Board*, RULE IV. DUTIES OF THE PRESIDENT, B. Duties Relative to Appointments, contemplates specifically allowing non-Board members to serve on other Boards.

Director Hernández expressed her regret that the appointment of former Director Sobel to the Retirement Board could not be considered separately. She expressed her belief that former Director Sobel has served the District well. She spoke about the County of Sonoma's unanimous decision to appoint someone else to the District's Board. She spoke about the damage inflicted by the difficult decision the Board made to lay off employees. She expressed her view that appointing former

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
JANUARY 22, 2021/PAGE 12**

Director Sobel to represent the District on the Retirement Board would invite further controversy. She counselled building back the trust with labor and making a fresh start.

Director Moylan stated that the Board has precedent for a non-Board member continuing to represent the Board on another Board. He spoke about former Director Boro continuing to serve on the Retirement Board after he stopped serving on the District Board. He also spoke about former Director Sobel's unique expertise and ability to contribute to the Retirement Board. He expressed his support for former Director Sobel.

Director Theriault stated he had struggled with his decision. He spoke about former Director Sobel's capabilities and dedication. He noted that the Sonoma County Board of Supervisors made a decision to appoint someone else to the District's Board. He also noted that there are other qualified candidates who could serve on the Retirement Board. He stated that another individual could bring a different flavor, viewpoint and contributions to the role. He presented his view that it is preferable that former members of a position leave the role to allow the new person filling the role to fill the position.

Director Rabbitt said that he supports the motion on the floor because he supports the President's appointments and former Director Sobel. He expressed his view that former Director Sobel's appointment does not slight anyone and he spoke about former Director Sobel's qualifications.

Director Fredericks encouraged the Board not to underestimate the Retirement Board members' abilities to work together collegially. She spoke about her support for the President's appointments. She spoke about Director Sobel's unique qualifications. She incorporated Director Rabbitt's comments.

Director Moylan spoke about his own labor background, his 72 years as a union member, and his ability to work across the aisle. He expressed his view that former Director Sobel is uniquely qualified.

Director Mastin spoke about his respect for former Director Sobel. He said he thought it was more appropriate to have a Board member fill the role representing the District.

Director Snyder spoke about his respect for former Director Sobel. He said he would have preferred to split the agenda item. He echoed Directors Theriault's and Hernández's comments about the appointment. He said he is a consensus builder. He noted there are many qualified candidates who could fill the role.

Director Arnold asked how frequently the Board has appointed former Directors to represent the Board. Mr. Mulligan responded that the Board appointed former Director Boro to continue to serve on the Retirement Board after he resigned from the District Board.

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
JANUARY 22, 2021/PAGE 13**

Director Arnold expressed her support for labor unions, and she spoke about the tough decisions the Board made. She said that she has thought for some time the new national leadership would bring a new climate and opportunities for increased funding. She expressed her view that not every issue has to be viewed through the lenses of how one would have voted on the layoffs. She expressed her support for the President's appointments.

Directors COCHRAN/MOYLAN ratifies appointments by the President of the Board of Directors to represent the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District (District) on other Boards, as follows:

Amalgamated Transit Health and Welfare Trust and Retirement Board
(3 Seats)

Trustees: Alice Fredericks, Brian Sobel and Michael Theriault
Term: February 1, 2021 to January 31, 2023

Sonoma-Marin Area Rail Transit District
(2 Seats)

Directors Patricia Garbarino and Barbara Pahre
Term: February 1, 2021 to January 31, 2023

Failed

[Director Cochran departed]

AYES (7): Directors Arnold, Fredericks, Garbarino, Moylan, Rabbitt and Rodoni; President Pahre.
NOES (5): Directors Hernández, Hill, Mastin and Snyder; First Vice President Theriault.
ABSENT (3): Directors Grosboll and Stefani; Second Vice President Cochran.

Mr. Mulligan stated that 10 affirmative votes are required to pass the item.

At the conclusion of the item, President Pahre asked if the Board would like to continue the Closed Session item until the next Board meeting.

[2:40:14 Hours Mark on the Audio Recording]

At the conclusion of the Agenda Item No. 10.F, **Directors Arnold/Theriault** moved and seconded to postpone the Closed Session item until the next Board meeting.

Carried

After the vote, President Pahre reported she heard calls for honesty and unity during the meeting. She expressed her hope that the Board members would work together in honesty and unity in the upcoming year.

[Director Cochran returned]

(G) Consider Possible Action to Terminate the Suspension of Board Procedural Rules and Policies For COVID-19 related Emergency Actions [2:41:45 Hours Mark on the Audio Recording]

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
JANUARY 22, 2021/PAGE 14**

Mr. Mulligan presented the staff report.

Directors RODONI/GARBARINO moved and seconded to continue consideration of this item until the next Board meeting.

Carried

AYES (13): Directors Arnold, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hernández, Hill, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Rodoni and Snyder; Second Vice President Cochran; First Vice President Theriault; President Pahre.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (2): Directors Grosboll and Stefani.

(12) UNFINISHED BUSINESS:

There was no "Unfinished Business" to discuss.

(13) NEW BUSINESS:

There was no "New Business" to discuss.

(14) COMMUNICATIONS: [2:44:29 Hours Mark on the Audio Recording]

A copy of Board Agenda Item No. 13, "Communications" is available on the District's web site or upon request from the Office of the District Secretary.

(15) ADJOURNMENT: [2:44:49 Hours Mark on the Audio Recording]

All business having been concluded **Directors COCHRAN/HERNÁNDEZ** moved and seconded that the meeting be adjourned at 12:45 a.m.

Carried

Respectfully submitted,



Amorette M. Ko-Wong
Secretary of the District

AMK:EIE:mjl