

December 20, 2019



**MINUTES OF THE**  
**RULES, POLICY AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE**

Honorable Board of Directors  
Golden Gate Bridge, Highway  
and Transportation District

Honorable Members:

A meeting of the Rules, Policy and Industrial Relations Committee (Committee) of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District (District) was held in the Board Room, Administration Building, Golden Gate Bridge Toll Plaza, San Francisco, CA, on Friday, December 20, 2019, at 9:01 a.m., Vice Chair Theriault presiding.

- (1) **Call to Order:** 9:01 a.m.
- (2) **Roll Call:** Secretary of the District Amorette M. Ko-Wong

**Committee Members Present (4):** Vice Chair Theriault; Directors Hernández and Hill; President Pahre.

**Committee Members Absent (4):** Chair Arnold; Directors Belforte, Grosboll and Walton.

**Other Directors Present (4):** Directors Cochran, Fredericks, Mastin, and Moylan.

**Staff Present:** General Manager Denis Mulligan; Auditor-Controller Joseph Wire; Secretary of the District Amorette Ko-Wong; Attorney Kimon Manolius; Deputy General Manager/Administration and Development Kellee Hopper; Deputy General Manager/Bridge Steve Miller; Division Deputy General Manager/Bus Transit Division Mona Babauta; Deputy General Manager/Ferry Division James Swindler; Senior Board Analyst Elizabeth Eells.

**Visitors Present:** None.

- (3) **Presentation on the District's Use of Temporary Employees**
  - (a) **Staff Report**

**RULES, POLICY AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE  
DECEMBER 20, 2019/PAGE 2**

In a memorandum to the Committee, Deputy General Manager/Administration and Development Kellee Hopper, and General Manager Denis Mulligan reported on the District's use of temporary employees. The report is provided for informational purposes and does not require any action. A copy of the staff report is available on the District's web site or upon request from the Office of the District Secretary.

**(b) Presentation of the Staff Report**

Ms. Hopper presented the staff report and stated that the report illustrates a snapshot in time. She said that currently, there are 22 temporary employees working for the District and soon, the number of temporary employees will be reduced to 18. She noted that the District's use of temporaries has increased and represents 3.25% of the District's total salaries.

Ms. Hopper stated that the 22 temporary employees can be split into three categories. She defined the first category as "temporary replacements." These employees are filling in for employees who have left their positions without adequate time to back fill the position; or for employees on long-term disability. In addition, some of these temporary employees provide a temporary bridge while a hiring manager re-evaluates department structure and staff requirements. She noted this category represents about half of the current 22 temporary employees.

She defined the second category as "specialized skill sets" – for situations in which specific skills are required for a limited duration. Ms. Hopper said that examples include the Kronos implementation, the Hastus upgrade, and the health benefits program. In these situations, temporary employees with specialized skills fill these limited duration roles. She said the District is currently utilizing three temporary employees who fall into this category.

She defined the third category as "special circumstances" in which someone is required to do a specific task for a limited duration that current personnel does not have the time to do. She said examples include the need for a Computer Aided Design technician for the Suicide Deterrent System project. She noted that some departments required additional personnel due to a sudden increase in workload. She also said the District is currently utilizing eight temporary employees in this category.

**(c) Discussion by the Committee**

Director Hernández thanked Ms. Hopper for the report. She noted that while Director Grosboll is absent today he would be interested in this report. She asked what the average duration is for someone working under the temporary replacement category and what is the least and longest duration a temporary employee worked for the District. Ms. Hopper responded the average time period varies. She said for an active recruitment, the District usually utilizes a temporary employee for a few months, but for a longer period in cases in which the department is restructuring. Ms. Hopper stated assignments have been as short as one week and as long as two years.

**RULES, POLICY AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE  
DECEMBER 20, 2019/PAGE 3**

Director Hernández observed that two years seems excessive for employing a temporary employee. She inquired as to what staff has learned about the District's use of temporary employees. She also asked if there are any policy changes being considered or if staff management and efficiencies could be improved. In response, Ms. Hopper stated that she has been very impressed with the quality of the temporary employees and many have been hired as full-time employees. She said many of the temporary employees possess different skill sets in the latest applications and practices as demonstrated by some of the organizational change items recently brought before the Board of Directors for approval. She noted it has been especially difficult to attract individuals with up-to-date technical skills for permanent positions.

Director Hernández asked what percentage of temporary employees become permanent employees and what is the average time these permanent employees worked as temporary employees before being hired. Ms. Hopper responded that she knows of eight temporary employees who have been hired as permanent employees. She offered to research the question, and return to the Board with the answer. Mr. Mulligan added there is a California Public Employees' Retirement System (CalPERS) rule that if an employee worked for an extended period of time as a temporary employee for a CalPERS employer, the CalPERS employer must make amends to the new employee's CalPERS by adding in the CalPERS employer pension contributions from when the newly hired employee started as a temporary employee.

Director Hernández asked if the District compensated the new employee at the lower salary they received as a temporary employee. Ms. Hopper said a temporary employee hired as a regular employee will always be paid the salary for the job classification and will never be paid less regardless of what the agency previously paid them.

Director Hernández asked how much of the decision to keep a temporary employee as a temporary employee a financial one. Ms. Hopper replied that keeping a temporary employee as a temporary employee is not a financial decision. Mr. Wire concurred.

Director Hernández asked if staff knows what the agency pays the temporary employee out of the hourly fee the District pays to the agency. Ms. Hopper stated the agency certifies the temporary employee's pay rate and its surcharge, which can be 30% to 40% or less of the total rate depending on the resource pool available.

Director Hernández stated that there are many reasons why the District uses temporary employees, and she noted she would like staff to be cautious of relying too heavily on temporary employees. She said she understands the District's use of temporary employees is not being driven by a desire to save money. She added she recognizes that some individuals may prefer to work short-term temporary assignments but believes most people are looking for permanent employment and advancement opportunities. She expressed her opinion that the Board must prioritize its goal of hiring full-time employees in a timely manner. She said she would like to continue to have conversations with Ms. Hopper on the matter. Mr. Mulligan said that the District's goal is to continue to provide permanent employment opportunities and staff will continue moving towards that goal.

**RULES, POLICY AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE  
DECEMBER 20, 2019/PAGE 4**

Director Cochran asked for confirmation that the District pays only the employer contribution of the newly hired regular employee back to the day the temporary employee began working for the District and does not pay the employee contribution. Ms. Hopper responded that the District pays the employer contribution of the CalPERS contribution back to the temporary employees' date of hire. She added that when a temporary employee works for a 1,000 hours, CalPERS is notified, and the District pays the employer contribution for 1,000 hours and for every hour paid the temporary or regular employee moving forward.

President Pahre asked for confirmation that temporary agencies pay benefits to their workers and if the District verifies that they are receiving health care. Ms. Hopper responded that the District relies on the agency's certification that the temporary employees receive benefits including the "healthy family" three days of paid sick leave the District subsidizes.

Chair Theriault thanked Directors Hernández and Grosboll for requesting this temporary employee review. He recommended staff anticipate its goal of evaluating positions and restructuring. He requested an annual report of the District's use of temporary employees.

**(4) Public Comment**

There was no public comment on items not on the Agenda.

**(5) Adjournment**

All business having been concluded, the meeting was adjourned at 9:24 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Michael Theriault, Vice Chair  
Rules, Policy and Industrial Relations Committee