



2019-08

GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE, HIGHWAY AND TRANSPORTATION DISTRICT

MEMORANDUM OF MINUTES

BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING

AUGUST 23, 2019

The Board of Directors (Board) of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District (District) met in regular session in the Board Room, Administration Building, Golden Gate Bridge Toll Plaza, San Francisco, CA, on Friday, August 23, 2019, at 10:11 a.m., President Hernández presiding.

- (1) **CALL TO ORDER:** 10:11 a.m.
- (2) **ROLL CALL:** Secretary of the District Amorette M. Ko-Wong

Directors Present (11): Directors Arnold, Brown, Cochran, Fewer, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hill, Sears, and Sobel; First Vice President Pahre; President Hernández.

Directors Absent (8): Directors Belforte, Grosboll, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Walton, and Yee; Second Vice President Theriault.

Staff Present: General Manager Denis Mulligan; Auditor-Controller Joseph Wire; District Engineer Ewa Bauer-Furbush; Secretary of the District Amorette Ko-Wong; Attorney Kimon Manolius; Attorney Alexandra Atencio, Attorney Mollie Kaban, Deputy General Manager/Administration and Development Kellee Hopper; Deputy General Manager/Bridge Division Steve Miller; Deputy General Manager/Bus Transit Division Mona Babauta; Deputy General Manager/Ferry Division James Swindler; Assistant Clerk of the Board Patsy Whala.

Visitors Present: Kymberlyrenée Gamboa, Sacramento County Resident; John Holden, Marin County Resident; Dave Rhody, San Francisco County Resident; Helena Birecki, San Francisco County Resident; Michael Thomas, Marin County Resident; Michelle Meyers, Marin County Resident; Juan Monsanto, San Francisco County Resident; Kim Stryker, San Francisco County Resident; Kathy Henning, San Francisco County Resident; Lianne McNeal, San Francisco County Resident; Kristin Tieche, Climate Reality.

- (3) **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:** Director Vallie Brown

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
AUGUST 23, 2019/PAGE 2**

(4) PUBLIC COMMENT:

(A) Public Comment

Kimberlyrenée Gamboa, Sacramento County Resident, spoke in support of the construction of the Suicide Deterrent System (SDS), and appreciation of the Bridge Patrol and their efforts to prevent suicides.

John Holden, Marin County Resident and Bus Operator, spoke in support of Julie Botelho, the August Employee of the Month and his Trainer two years ago. He encouraged the District to consider employees like Ms. Botelho as candidates for mentoring and internal promotion. Mr. Holden also mentioned his hope that there would be resolution in the ATU negotiation soon.

[Director Sears Arrived.]

Dave Rhody, San Francisco County Resident: See attached script copy of the speaker's statement.

Helena Birecki, San Francisco County Resident: See attached script copy of the speaker's statement.

Michael Thomas, Marin County Resident: See attached script copy of the speaker's statement.

Michelle Meyers, Marin County Resident: See attached script copy of the speaker's statement.

Juan Monsanto, San Francisco County Resident: See attached script copy of the speaker's statement.

Kim Stryker, San Francisco County Resident: See attached script copy of the speaker's statement.

Kathy Henning, San Francisco County Resident: See attached script copy of the speaker's statement.

Lianne McNeal, San Francisco County Resident: See attached script copy of the speaker's statement.

Kristin Tieche: See attached script copy of the speaker's statement.

(B) Discussion by Board

President Hernández recognized the Climate Reality Project speakers and requested staff review the petition submitted, and discuss and submit an appropriate recommendation.

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
AUGUST 23, 2019/PAGE 3**

Director Sears commented on her previous positive experience with the Climate Reality Project, and the content of the Petition. She supported accelerating the transition of the District's Ferries and Buses into electric propulsion.

Director Fewer confirmed the City and County of San Francisco did adopt a climate emergency resolution. She noted San Francisco is reviewing many of the items included in the Petition presented today such as increasing bicycle accessibility, migrating to all electric vehicles, and requiring new buildings have electric vehicle charging stations. San Francisco is also considering a resolution or ordinance to ban natural gas in new construction.

President Hernández stated that she has asked the General Manager to summarize the District's efforts to date and the plans to address climate issues.

(5) CONSENT CALENDAR:

Directors PAHRE/COCHRAN moved and seconded to approve the Consent Calendar. All items were approved by the following vote of the Board of Directors:

AYES (11): Directors Arnold, Brown, Cochran, Fewer, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hill, Sears, and Sobel; First Vice President Pahre; President Hernández.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (8): Directors, Belforte, Grosboll, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Walton, and Yee; Second Vice President Theriault.

(A) Approve the Minutes of the following Meetings

- (1) Transportation Committee of July 25, 2019;
- (2) Building and Operating Committee of July 25, 2019;
- (3) Finance-Auditing Committee of July 25, 2019;
- (4) Rules, Policy and Industrial Relations Committee of July 26, 2019; and
- (5) Board of Directors of July 26, 2019. **Carried**

(B) Ratification of Previous Actions by the Auditor-Controller

Resolution No. 2019-059 (as detailed in the August 22, 2019 Finance-Auditing Committee meeting)

- (1) Ratify Commitments and/or Expenditures
- (2) Ratify Previous Investments
- (3) Authorize Investments
- (4) Accept Investment Report July 2019 **Adopted**

(6) REPORTS OF OFFICERS:

(A) General Manager

(1) Presentation of Awards

Presentation of Employee of the Month Award for August 2019, to Julie Botelho, Bus Operator, Bus Division

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
AUGUST 23, 2019/PAGE 4**

President Hernández presented the Employee of the Month Award for August 2019, to Julie Botelho, Bus Operator, Bus Division, and expressed her congratulations on behalf of the Board of Directors.

(2) Report of the General Manager

Mr. Mulligan stated that all items contained in the written General Manager's Report are informational only and that there was no "What We Do" video for presentation. A copy of the General Manager's Report is available on the District's web site or upon request from the Office of the District Secretary.

At President Hernández's suggestion, Mr. Mulligan commented on the District and climate issues. He stated that he believes everyone in the room shares the values espoused by the speakers and has strong interest that the Board would adopt a Resolution to support the values expressed by the speakers today and the petition submitted. He said that staff will return to future Committee and Board meetings with a resolution.

Mr. Mulligan highlighted that the District is on the path to bus electrification and agreed that renewable diesel has a wide range of effectiveness. He reported that the District intends to hire a consultant to help with full electrification of its buses. He stated that District customers have choices between three modes of transportation including buses, ferries, and driving, and they are sensitive to travel time. He added that using today's electric ferry technology would slow down the District's fleet considerably, and until the broader community embraces a slower travel time, the District believes electric ferries would have a negative impact on the Bridge roadway because driving would be faster than an electric ferry. He stated that the District is interested in electrifying its fleet as quickly as possible and the Spaulding class vessels will be the first probabilities for electrification because they do shorter trips and have the capacity for installation of the additional equipment that will be necessary to electrify the ferries.

Mr. Mulligan further added that staff will be presenting an item dealing with bikes on the Bridge, expressly dealing with electric bikes to allow the District to go through the proper public outreach process to solicit public comments. Correspondingly, he stated that on a busy day over 8,000 bikes cross the Bridge and some bicyclists are frustrated due to some obstructions on a portion of the west sidewalk due to the SDS Project construction. He noted that the contractor requires access to the west sidewalk and therefore cannot be exclusively used for bicycles.

He concluded with a statement that at a future meeting staff will present the Board with a resolution that embodies the Board's intent and looks forward to the Board's discussion on the matter.

(3) Discussion by the Board

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
AUGUST 23, 2019/PAGE 5**

Director Sears added that Marin Transit is testing two electric buses and that Golden Gate Transit is closely watching the results of those tests to help make informed decisions about the future of the fleet. Mr. Mulligan agreed that the data garnered is important to the future of Golden Gate Transit and staff is adapting to the changes in electronics of bus technology.

Director Hill commented on the traffic on the Bridge and the District's congestion management efforts. Mr. Mulligan added that on weekdays from 5:00 a.m. to 9:00 a.m., over 20% of all trips into San Francisco are on District buses and ferries.

President Hernández thanked the community for speaking to the Board and reminded fellow Directors to submit discussion topics for a future Board workshop.

(B) Attorney

(1) Report of the Attorney

Attorney Kimon Manolius stated that all items contained in the written Attorney's Report are informational. A copy of the Attorney's Report is available on the District's web site or upon request from the Office of the District Secretary.

(2) Closed Session

Attorney Manolius reported that, that a Closed Session will take place just prior to the conclusion of this meeting, to discuss the following matter, listed on the Board Agenda as Item No. 6.B.1:

**(a) Conference with Legal Counsel – Existing Litigation
Pursuant to Government Code Section 54956.9(a)
Report of Hanson Bridgett, LLP**

- (i) Michael Saliani v. Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District, San Francisco Superior Court; Case Number CGC-14-540384.**
- (ii) Pamela Moore v. Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District, San Francisco Superior Court; Case No. CGC-15-549048.**
- (iii) Kristin Freeland and Michael Jefferson v. Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District, San Francisco Superior Court; Case No. CGC-16-550947.**

**(b) Conference with Labor Negotiator
Pursuant to Government Code Section 54957.6
Report of Hanson Bridgett, LLP**

- (i) Negotiations with the Amalgamated Transit Union, Local No. 1575**

(C) District Engineer

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
AUGUST 23, 2019/PAGE 6**

(1) Report of the District Engineer

Ms. Bauer-Furbush stated that all items contained in the Engineer's Report are informational only. A copy of the Engineer's Report is available on the District's web site or upon request from the Office of the District Secretary.

She provided a brief report on the progress of the SDS Project stating that the contractor is continuing with installation of net supports on the Bridge's main suspension span with 63 fully installed. She added that 500 feet of new bridge railing has been installed, the contractor is working on the installation of work access platforms on the north approach viaduct and is preparing for the installation of the fifth large platform on the suspension bridge. She stated that fabrication of the structural steel is reaching 80%. She said that staff is having extensive meetings with the contractor to resolve issues and disputes on a very complex project.

President Hernández encouraged fellow members to tour the bridge to view the complexities of maintenance on the bridge and understand the magnitude of details involved in the SDS project.

(7) OTHER REPORTS:

There were no "Other Reports" to discuss.

(8) REPORT OF COMMITTEES:

**(A) Meeting of the Building and Operating Committee/Committee of the Whole
August 22, 2019
Chair Michael Theriault**

**(1) Authorize Execution of Contract Change Order No. 62 to Contract No.
2016-B-1, Golden Gate Bridge Physical Suicide Deterrent System and
Wind Retrofit Project**

Directors GARBARINO/COCHRAN

Resolution No. 2019-060 authorizes execution of Contract Change Order (CCO) No. 62 to Contract No. 2016-B-1, *Golden Gate Bridge Suicide Deterrent System and Wind Retrofit Project*, in the amount of \$420,685 for modifications to the suicide deterrent system wire mesh splice details; with the understanding that sufficient funds are available in the Contract No. 2016-B-1 construction contingency to finance this CCO.

Adopted

AYES (11): Directors Arnold, Brown, Cochran, Fewer, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hill, Sears, and Sobel; First Vice President Pahre; President Hernández.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (8): Directors, Belforte, Grosboll, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Walton, and Yee; Second Vice President Theriault.

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
AUGUST 23, 2019/PAGE 7**

- (2) **Approve Award of Sole Source Contract No. 2019-F-023, *Procurement and Installation of MRAD System for Golden Gate Ferry Fleet*, to Vector Controls Inc.**

Directors GARBARINO/HILL

Resolution No. 2019-061 approves award of Sole Source Contract No. 2019-F-023, Procurement and Installation of MRAD System for Golden Gate Ferry Fleet, to Vector Controls Inc., Newton, MA, in the not to exceed amount of \$312,036.

Adopted

AYES (11): Directors Arnold, Brown, Cochran, Fewer, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hill, Sears, and Sobel; First Vice President Pahre; President Hernández.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (8): Directors, Belforte, Grosboll, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Walton, and Yee; Second Vice President Theriault.

- (3) **Approve Actions Relative to the Award of Sole Source Contract No. 2019-F-043, *Diesel Engines and Control Systems for Spaulding Class Vessels*, to Pacific Power Group**

Directors GARBARINO/FREDERICKS

Resolution No. 2019-062 approves actions relative to the award of Sole Source Contract No. 2019-F-043, *Diesel Engines and Control Systems for Spaulding Class Vessels*, to Pacific Power Group, as follows:

- (a) Authorizes sole source procurement and award of Contract No. 2019-F-043 to Pacific Power Group of Kent, WA, in the amount of \$1,150,000, inclusive of tax for two engines; and,
- (b) Authorizes a contract contingency of \$150,000, to cover unforeseen materials or service in support of the required preservation and storage.

Adopted

AYES (11): Directors Arnold, Brown, Cochran, Fewer, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hill, Sears, and Sobel; First Vice President Pahre; President Hernández.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (8): Directors, Belforte, Grosboll, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Walton, and Yee; Second Vice President Theriault.

- (4) **Approve Actions Relative to the Award of Sole Source Contract No. 2019-F-041, *Marine Gearboxes for Spaulding Class Vessels*, to ZF Marine**

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
AUGUST 23, 2019/PAGE 8**

Directors GARBARINO/COCHRAN

Resolution No. 2019-063 approves actions relative to the award of Sole Source Contract No. 2019-F-041, *Marine Gearboxes for Spaulding Class Vessels*, to ZF Marine, as follows:

- (a) Authorizes sole source procurement and award of Contract No. 2019-F-041 to ZF Marine of Mukilteo, WA, in the amount of \$400,000 inclusive of tax for two gearboxes; and,
- (b) Authorizes a contract contingency of \$70,000 to cover unforeseen materials or service in support of the required preservation and storage.

Adopted

AYES (11): Directors Arnold, Brown, Cochran, Fewer, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hill, Sears, and Sobel; First Vice President Pahre; President Hernández.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (8): Directors, Belforte, Grosboll, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Walton, and Yee; Second Vice President Theriault.

- (5) **Approve Actions Relative to the M.V. Del Norte, M.V. Napa and M.V. Golden Gate Main Engine Overhaul, Scheduled Dry Dockings and Capital Improvements Project**

Directors GARBARINO/SOBEL

Resolution No. 2019-064 approves actions relative to the *M.V. Del Norte, M.V. Napa and M.V. Golden Gate Main Engine Overhaul, Scheduled Dry Dockings and Capital Improvements Project*, as follows:

- (a) Ratifies the General Manager's authorization of Change Order #2 to Contract No. 2018-F-088, *M.V. Napa, M.V. Del Norte and M.V. Golden Gate Scheduled Dry Dockings and Capital Improvements* and payment of same in the amount of \$892,095;
- (b) Authorizes an increase to the contract contingency for Contract No. 2018-F-088, in the amount of \$1,350,000, from \$1,000,000 to \$2,350,000; and,
- (c) Authorizes an increase in the FY 19/20 Ferry Division Capital Budget for Project #1941, *M.V. Del Norte, M.V. Napa and M.V. Golden Gate Main Engine Overhaul, Scheduled Dry Dockings and Capital Improvements Project*, in the amount of \$738,241, which, along with a reduction in the contract contingency for Contract 2018-FT-079 discussed in this report, will fund completion of the project, including the increased contingency in Contract No. 2018-F-088; as concurred with by the Finance-Auditing Committee at its meeting of August 22, 2019.

Adopted

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
AUGUST 23, 2019/PAGE 9**

AYES (11): Directors Arnold, Brown, Cochran, Fewer, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hill, Sears, and Sobel; First Vice President Pahre; President Hernández.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (8): Directors, Belforte, Grosboll, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Walton, and Yee; Second Vice President Theriault.

President Hernández asked Mr. Swindler to restate his comments regarding the superior workmanship in the Spaulding-class vessels that he expressed at the August 22, 2019 Building and Operating Committee meeting. He repeated his acknowledgements about the vessels and reiterated that due to the capacity of those vessels they would be the first to get the equipment for electronic propulsion when the technology becomes available.

(9) ADDRESSES TO BOARD:

There were no “Addresses to Board” to discuss.

(10) SPECIAL ORDER OF BUSINESS:

There was no “Special Order of Business” to discuss.

(11) UNFINISHED BUSINESS:

(A) Closed Session

Attorney Kim Manolius, at the request of President Hernández, stated that the Board would convene in Closed Session, as permitted by the Brown Act, to discuss the matters listed on the Board Agenda as Closed Session, Items No. 6.B.1.a. and 6.B.1.b.

(B) Open Session

After Closed Session, President Hernández called the meeting to order in Open Session with a quorum present. Attorney Manolius reported that the Board had met in Closed Session, as permitted by the Brown Act, regarding the items listed as Closed Session outlined above. He reported that there was nothing to report regarding Closed Session Item No. 6.B.1.b. He also reported that the Board was briefed and gave counsel direction on how to proceed with Closed Session Item No. 6.B.1.a.

(12) NEW BUSINESS:

There was no “New Business” to discuss.

(13) COMMUNICATIONS:

A copy of Board Agenda Item No. 13, “Communications”, is available on the District’s web site or upon request from the Office of the District Secretary.

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING
AUGUST 23, 2019/PAGE 10**

(14) ADJOURNMENT:

All business having been concluded, **Directors PAHRE/HILL** moved and seconded that the meeting be adjourned at 11:55 a.m. in honor of Howard Deguara, Terri Horn, Declan Weller Brogan, the Victims of the: Gilroy Garlic Festival Shooting on July 28; El Paso, Texas Shooting on August 3; and the Dayton, Ohio Shooting on August 4.

Carried

AYES (11): Directors Arnold, Brown, Cochran, Fewer, Fredericks, Garbarino, Hill, Sears, and Sobel; First Vice President Pahre; President Hernández.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (8): Directors, Belforte, Grosboll, Mastin, Moylan, Rabbitt, Walton, and Yee; Second Vice President Theriault.

Respectfully submitted,



Amorette M. Ko-Wong
Secretary of the District

AMK:EIE:PLW:mjl