



Agenda Item No. 2

To: Transportation Committee/Committee of the Whole  
Meeting of February 11, 2010

From: Lisa Locati, Bridge Captain  
Kary H. Witt, Deputy General Manager, Bridge Division  
Teri W. Mantony, Deputy General Manager, Bus Division  
James P. Swindler, Deputy General Manager, Ferry Division  
Celia G. Kupersmith, General Manager

Subject: **APPROVE ACTIONS RELATIVE TO THE AWARD OF CONTRACT NO. 2010-MD-3, SECURITY GUARD SERVICES FOR BUS AND FERRY FACILITIES, TO BARBIER SECURITY GROUP**

**Recommendation**

The Transportation Committee recommends that the Board of Directors approve actions relative to Contract No. 2010-MD-3, *Security Guard Services for the Bus and Ferry Facilities*, as follows:

1. Reject the protests of First Alarm Security & Patrol, Inc. and Cypress Private Security, Inc.; and,
2. Authorize award of RFP No. 2010-MD-3, *Security Guard Services for the Bus and Ferry Facilities*, to Barbier Security Group, San Rafael, CA, in an amount not to exceed \$475,514, for a two-year period effective March 1, 2010, with two successive one-year options on the same terms and conditions with the exception of a cost increase of up to five percent (5%) subject to satisfactory documentation and District approval, exercisable by the General Manager or designee;

with the understanding that sufficient funds for this procurement are available in the FY 09/10 Bus and Ferry Divisions' Operating Budgets; and, with the further understanding that sufficient funds will be included in future years' budgets.

**Background**

This contract is for security guard services at the Santa Rosa, Novato and San Rafael Bus facilities, the San Rafael Transit Center, the Larkspur Ferry Terminal, and San Francisco Ferry Terminal. These services have been provided by Silicon Valley Security & Patrol, Inc., whose contract expires on February 28, 2010.

**A. Evaluation Process**

A Request for Proposals (RFP) to provide security guard services was issued detailing the scope of services for the District. Twelve proposals were received as follows:

- ABC Security Service, Inc.
- Allied Barton Security Services, LP
- Barbier Security Group
- Black Bear Security Services, Inc.
- CEED Security Services, Inc.
- Cypress Private Security, LLC
- Execushield, Inc.
- First Alarm Security & Patrol, Inc.
- Jalala, Inc. dba American Discount Security
- Marina Securities Services, Inc.
- Silicon Valley Security & Patrol, Inc.
- Whitestone Government Security Services, Inc.

An Evaluation Committee (Committee) composed of qualified District staff reviewed, evaluated, and scored each proposal in accordance with the weighted criteria set forth in the RFP documents as follows:

- |  |            |
|--|------------|
| ▪ Estimated Grand Total Proposal Price | 40 percent |
| ▪ Firm Experience and Qualifications   | 40 percent |
| ▪ References                           | 20 percent |

Based upon an initial screening of all written proposals, the four top scoring proposals were determined to be within the competitive range:

- Allied Barton Security Services, LP
- Barbier Security Group
- Cypress Private Security, LLC
- Execushield, Inc.

Interviews were scheduled with these four firms and references were checked. The RFP provides that the District has the right to conduct negotiations with any or all proposers within the competitive range and to request additional information. Accordingly, the four finalists were given the opportunity to submit a modified price proposal. Two firms, Cypress Private Security, Inc. (Cypress) and Execushield, Inc. elected to submit modified price proposals.

The Committee completed the final evaluation and consensus ranking of the four finalists and determined that Barbier Security Group (Barbier) was the highest ranked firm. Barbier's proposal scored highest in the qualitative criteria by distinguishing itself from the other finalists in several ways. A majority of the work under this contract will be provided in the community of San Rafael, where Barbier primarily provides security guard services and has demonstrated an excellent understanding of the community. Barbier also had outstanding references, who conveyed to the Committee that Barbier provides high quality service, is highly responsive and communicative, and

hires motivated and engaged security personnel. Further, Barbier appears to have an interactive approach with the public and impressed the Committee with its professionalism. These attributes are particularly important as the scope of services at the San Rafael Transit Center, the location where the majority of security guard services will be provided, includes a great deal of interaction with the District's transit customers. These attributes will also be helpful at several District locations where loitering is a concern. While other finalists had a more standardized approach to providing the desired services, Barbier's local, hands-on approach to providing security services was determined to be a better fit for the District's needs.

**B. Protests Received by the District**

Following announcement of the District's intention to award this contract to Barbier, The District received two protests.

The first protest, from First Alarm Security & Patrol, Inc. (First Alarm), alleged the following: (1) Barbier did not submit the lowest cost proposal, (2) Barbier's owner was not licensed as a Private Patrol Officer for a long enough time to have the required experience, and (3) Barbier allowed a current employee to work as a security guard without a valid security guard card and without a proper uniform.

Regarding the first allegation, the recommendation of award is not based on a lowest responsible bidder standard. Rather, it is recommended based on an evaluation of qualitative criteria, as well as cost. Cost is a factor, but is not the sole determinant. The qualitative criteria totaled 60 points, whereas Estimated Grand Total Proposal Price accounted for only 40 points. First Alarm's proposed costs were competitive and as a result, it received more points in this evaluation category than Barbier did. However, First Alarm's proposal received far fewer points than Barbier for the non-cost evaluation. Therefore, First Alarm's total score was lower than Barbier's total score.

Regarding the second and third allegations, Barbier has submitted a letter to the District disputing First Security's allegations and has provided evidence satisfactory to the District that (1) its owner has been licensed as a Private Patrol Operator for a long enough time to have acquired the required experience, and (2) the employee in question has a valid security guard card and a proper uniform.

The second protest, submitted by Cypress, was received by the District after the date due for proposal protests. Besides being untimely, Cypress' protest does not allege any impropriety in the evaluation process, but basically disagrees with Staff's exercise of judgment. Cypress claims it should have been scored higher than Barbier in both experience and price. Cypress' price proposal was lower than Barbier's and was scored higher in that evaluation category. However, as stated above, cost was not the determining factor for recommendation of the award. In the categories of firm experience and qualifications, including key personnel and references, Cypress scored lower than Barbier. This reflects the considered judgment of the Committee that Barbier, on balance, was a closer fit for the District's security needs, as explained above. While Cypress demonstrated relevant experience and ability, its total score was lower than Barbier's total score.

Based on the analysis above, Staff recommends that the protests of First Alarm and Cypress be rejected.

**C. Other Information**

The District's Attorney and the DBE Program Office have reviewed the proposals and find that Barbier has properly submitted all required documents and that their proposal is responsive to the RFP.

Since there were no subcontracting opportunities for this contract, there were no DBE forms required for submittal. The DBE Program Office has determined that Barbier is not certified as a DBE. Therefore, no DBE participation is anticipated during the performance of this contract. The District's current contract for security services expires on February 28, 2010. Staff is recommending award of this contract effective March 1, 2010, to ensure continuous security services at the Santa Rosa, Novato, and San Rafael Bus facilities, the San Rafael Transit Center, the Larkspur Ferry Terminal, and San Francisco Ferry Terminal.

**Fiscal Impact**

Barbier Security Group's price proposal is within the budget allocated for this contract and is \$557 less than the expiring contract for a two-year period. The estimated cost of Contract No. 2010-MD-3, *Security Guard Services for the Bus and Ferry Facilities*, is \$475,514 for a two-year period. It is anticipated that the services for the remainder of FY 09/10 will be approximately \$80,000 and sufficient funds are available in the Bus and Ferry Divisions' Operating Budgets. The remaining costs will be budgeted in future year budgets accordingly.